

# Codes and Standards Title 24 Energy-Efficient Local Ordinances

## Title: Climate Zone 4 Energy Cost-Effectiveness Study

### Prepared for:

Pat Eilert  
Codes and Standards Program  
Pacific Gas and Electric Company

Maril Pitcock  
Government Partnership Program  
Pacific Gas and Electric Company

### Prepared by:

Gabel Associates, LLC

Last Modified: August 26, 2010



## Climate Zone 4 Energy Cost-Effectiveness Study

August 26, 2010

Report prepared by:

Michael Gabel of Gabel Associates, LLC  
1818 Harmon Street, Suite #1 Berkeley, CA 94703  
(510) 428-0803 Email: mike@gabelenergy.com

Report on behalf of:

Pacific Gas and Electric Company's Codes and Standards Program,  
Pat Eilert, 202 Cousteau Place, Davis, CA 95616  
(530) 757-5261 Email: PLE2@pge.com

Pacific Gas and Electric Company's Government Partnership Program,  
Maril Pitcock, 245 Market, San Francisco, Room 687, CA 94105  
(415) 973-9944 Email: MxWL@pge.com

## **LEGAL NOTICE**

This report was prepared by Pacific Gas and Electric Company and funded by the California utility customers under the auspices of the California Public Utilities Commission.

Copyright 2009 Pacific Gas and Electric Company. All rights reserved, except that this document may be used, copied, and distributed without modification.

Neither PG&E nor any of its employees makes any warranty, express or implied; or assumes any legal liability or responsibility for the accuracy, completeness or usefulness of any data, information, method, product, policy or process disclosed in this document; or represents that its use will not infringe any privately-owned rights including, but not limited to, patents, trademarks or copyrights.

**Table of Contents**

<b>1.0 Executive Summary .....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>2.0 Methodology and Assumptions .....</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>3.0 Minimum Compliance With 2008 Standards .....</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>4.0 Incremental Cost to Exceed Title 24 By 15% .....</b>	<b>9</b>
<b>5.0 Cost-Effectiveness Determination.....</b>	<b>23</b>

## **1.0 Executive Summary**

This report presents the results of Gabel Associates' research and review of the feasibility and energy cost-effectiveness of building permit applicants exceeding the 2008 Building Energy Efficiency Standards to meet the minimum energy-efficiency requirements of local energy efficiency standards covering Climate Zone 4. A local government may use this report as a basis for demonstrating energy cost-effectiveness of a proposed green building or energy ordinance. The study assumes that such an ordinance requires, for the building categories covered, that building energy performance exceeds the 2008 TDV energy standard budget by at least 15%.

The study is also contained in the local government's application to the California Energy Commission (CEC) which must meet all requirements specified in Section 10-106 of the California Code of Regulations, Title 24, Part 1, Article 1: Locally Adopted Energy Standards. An ordinance shall be legally enforceable (a) after the CEC has reviewed and approved the local energy standards as meeting all requirements of Section 10-106; and (b) the ordinance has been adopted by the local government and filed with the Building Standards Commission.

The 2008 Building Energy Efficiency Standards, which took effect on January 1, 2010, are the baseline used to calculate the cost-effectiveness data.

## **2.0 Methodology and Assumptions**

The energy performance impacts of exceeding the performance requirements of the 2008 Title 24 Building Energy Efficiency Standards (2008 Standards) have been evaluated in Climate Zone 4 using the following residential and nonresidential prototypical building types:

<b>Small Single Family House</b> 2-story 2,025 sf	<b>Large Single Family House</b> 2-story 4,500 sf
<b>Low-rise Multi-family Apartments</b> 8 dwelling units/2-story 8,442 sf	<b>High-rise Multi-family Apartments</b> 40 dwelling units/4-story 36,800 sf
<b>Low-rise Office Building</b> 1-story 10,580 sf	<b>High-rise Office Building</b> 5-story 52,900 sf

### **Methodology**

The methodology used in the case studies is based on a design process for each of the proposed prototypical building types that first meets the minimum requirements and then exceeds the 2008 Standards by 15%. The process includes the following major stages:

#### ***Stage 1: Minimum Compliance with 2008 Standards:***

Each prototype building design is tested for minimum compliance with the 2008 Standards, and the mix of energy measures are adjusted using common construction options so the building first just meets the Standards. The set of energy measures chosen represent a reasonable combination which reflects how designers, builders and developers are likely to achieve a specified level of performance using a relatively low first incremental (additional) cost.

#### ***Stage 2: Incremental Cost for Exceeding 2008 Standards by 15%:***

Starting with that set of measures which is minimally compliant with the 2008 Standards, various energy measures are upgraded so that the building just exceeds the 2008 Standards by 15%. The design choices by the consultant authoring this study are based on many years of experience with architects, builders, mechanical engineers; and general knowledge of the relative acceptance and preferences of many measures, as well as their incremental costs. This approach tends to reflect how building energy performance is typically evaluated for code compliance and how it's used to select design energy efficiency measures. Note that lowest simple payback with respect to building site energy is not the primary focus of selecting measures; but rather the requisite reduction of Title 24 Time Dependent Valuation(TDV) energy at a reasonable incremental cost consistent with other non-monetary but important design considerations. A minimum and

maximum range of incremental costs of added energy efficiency measures is established by a variety of research means. A construction cost estimator, Building Advisory LLC, was contracted to conduct research to obtain current measure cost information for many energy measures; and Gabel Associates performed its own additional research to establish first cost data.

### ***Stage 3: Cost Effectiveness Determination:***

Energy savings in kWh and therms is calculated from the Title 24 simulation results to establish the annual energy cost savings and CO<sub>2</sub>-equivalent reductions in greenhouse gases. A simple payback analysis in years is calculated by dividing the incremental cost for exceeding the 2008 Standards by the estimated annual energy cost savings.

### **Assumptions**

#### ***Annual Energy Cost Savings***

1. Annual site electricity (kWh) and natural gas (therms) saved are calculated using Micropas 8, state-approved energy compliance software for the 2008 Building Energy Efficiency Standards.
2. Average residential utility rates of \$0.18/kWh for electricity and \$1.15/therm for natural gas in current constant dollars; nonresidential rates are time-of-use rate schedules modeled explicitly in the DOE-2.1E computer simulation: PG&E A-6 schedule for electricity and PG&E G-NR1 schedule for natural gas.
3. No change (i.e., no inflation or deflation) of utility rates in constant dollars
4. No increase in summer temperatures from global climate change

#### ***Simple Payback Analysis***

1. No external cost of global climate change -- and corresponding value of additional investment in energy efficiency and CO<sub>2</sub> reduction -- is included
2. The cost of money (e.g., opportunity cost) invested in the incremental cost of energy efficiency measures is not included.

### **3.0 Minimum Compliance with 2008 Standards**

The following energy design descriptions of the following building prototypes just meet the 2008 Standards in Climate Zone 4.

#### **Small Single Family House**

- 2,025 square feet
- 2-story
- 20.2% glazing/floor area ratio

#### **Base Case with No Air Conditioning**

<b>Energy Efficiency Measures</b>
R-38 Roof w/ Radiant Barrier
R-13 Walls
R-19 Raised Floor over Garage/Open at 2nd Floor
R-0 Slab on Grade
Low E2 Vinyl Windows, U=0.36, SHGC=0.30
Furnace: 80% AFUE
Air Conditioner: None
R-6 Attic Ducts
50 Gallon Gas Water Heater: EF=0.62

#### **Base Case With Air Conditioning**

<b>Energy Efficiency Measures</b>
R-38 Roof w/ Radiant Barrier
R-13 Walls
R-19 Raised Floor over Garage/Open at 2nd Floor
R-0 Slab on Grade
Low E2 Vinyl Windows, U=0.36, SHGC=0.30
Furnace: 80% AFUE
Air Conditioner: 13 SEER
R-6 Attic Ducts
50 Gallon Gas Water Heater: EF=0.62

### **Large Single Family House**

- 4,500 square feet
- 2-story
- 22.0% glazing/floor area ratio

### **Base Case with No Air Conditioning**

<b>Energy Efficiency Measures</b>
R-38 Roof w/ Radiant Barrier R-13 Walls R-19 Raised Floor Low E2 Vinyl Windows, U=0.36, SHGC=0.30 (2) Furnaces: 80% AFUE Air Conditioner: None R-6 Attic Ducts Reduced Duct Leakage/Testing (HERS) (2) 50 Gallon Gas Water Heaters: EF=0.62

### **Base Case With Air Conditioning**

<b>Energy Efficiency Measures</b>
R-38 Roof w/ Radiant Barrier R-13 Walls R-19 Raised Floor Low E2 Vinyl Windows, U=0.36, SHGC=0.30 (2) Furnaces: 80% AFUE (2) Air Conditioners: 13 SEER R-6 Attic Ducts Reduced Duct Leakage/Testing (HERS) (2) 50 Gallon Gas Water Heaters: EF=0.62

### **Low-rise Multi-family Apartments**

- 8,442 square feet
- 8 units/2-story
- 12.5% glazing/floor area ratio

### **Base Case with No Air Conditioning**

<b>Energy Efficiency Measures</b>
R-19 Roof w/ Radiant Barrier R-13 Walls R-0 Slab on Grade Low E2 Vinyl Windows, U=0.36, SHGC=0.30 (8) Furnaces: 80% AFUE Air Conditioner: None R-6 Attic Ducts (8) 40 Gallon Gas Water Heaters: EF=0.63

### **Base Case With Air Conditioning**

<b>Energy Efficiency Measures</b>
R-19 Roof w/ Radiant Barrier R-13 Walls R-0 Slab on Grade Low E2 Vinyl Windows, U=0.36, SHGC=0.30 (8) Furnaces: 80% AFUE (8) Air Conditioner: 13 SEER R-6 Attic Ducts (8) 40 Gallon Gas Water Heaters: EF=0.63

### **High-rise Multifamily Apartments**

- 36,800 sf,
- 40 units
- 4-story
- Window to Wall Ratio = 35.2%

<b>Energy Efficiency Measures to Meet Title 24</b>
R-19 Metal Roof w/ R-19 batt insulation below; no cool roof
R-19 in Metal Frame Walls
R-4 (1.25") Raised Slab over parking garage
Dual Metal Windows: COG U-factor=0.30, COG SHGC=0.54
1.5 ton 4-pipe fan coils, 80% AFUE boiler, 70-ton scroll air cooled chiller 0.72 KW/ton
Central DHW boiler: 80% AFUE and recirculating system w/ timer-temperature controls

### **Low-rise Office Building**

- Single Story
- 10,580 sf,
- Window to Wall Ratio = 37.1%

<b>Energy Efficiency Measures to Meet Title 24</b>
R-19 Metal Roof w/ R-19 batt below; no cool roof
R-19 in Metal Frame Walls
R-0 (un-insulated) slab-on-grade 1st floor
Metal windows: default glazing U=0.71, default SHGC=0.73
Lighting = 0.858 w/sf: Open Office Areas: (60) 2-lamp T8 fixtures @58w each; (24) 18w recessed CFLs no lighting controls. Small Offices: (48) 2-lamp T8 fixtures; (40) 18w recessed CFLs, no controls. Support Areas: (32) 18w recessed CFLs; (48) 13w CFL wall sconces; no controls.
(2) 13-ton DX units EER=11.6; 82% AFUE furnaces; standard efficiency fan motors; fixed temp. integrated air economizers
R-6 duct insulation w/ ducts on roof, HERS verified duct leakage
(1) 50 gallon or less tank Gas Water Heaters EF=0.58

### **High-rise Office Building**

- 5-story
- 52,900 sf,
- Window to Wall Ratio = 34.5%

<b>Energy Efficiency Measures to Meet Title 24</b>
R-19 Metal Roof; no cool roof
R-19 in Metal Frame Walls
R-0 (un-insulated) slab-on-grade 1st floor
Metal windows: default U=0.71, default SHGC=0.73
Lighting = 0.858 w/sf: Open Office Areas: (300) 2-lamp T8 fixtures @58w each; no lighting controls; (120) 18w recessed CFLs no lighting controls. Small Offices: (280) 2-lamp T8 fixtures on/off lighting controls; (200) 18w recessed CFLs no lighting controls. Support Areas: (160) 18w recessed CFLs no lighting controls; (240) 13w CFL wall sconces; no lighting controls.
(4) 55-ton Packaged VAV EER=10.1; 80% TE furnaces; standard efficiency variable speed fan motors; no air economizers; 15% VAV boxes, electric reheat on perimeter zones
R-6 duct insulation w/ ducts in conditioned
Standard Tank Gas Water Heaters EF=0.58

## 4.0 Incremental Cost to Exceed 2008 Standards by 15%

The following tables list the energy features and/or equipment included in the 2008 Standards base design, the efficient measure options, and an estimate of the incremental cost for each measure included **to improve the building performance to use 15% less TDV energy than the corresponding Title 24 base case design.**

### Small Single Family House

- 2,025 square feet
- 2-story
- 20.2% glazing/floor area ratio

#### **Incremental Cost Estimate to Exceed Title 24 by 15%** **Single Family Prototype: 2,025 SF, Option 1 - No AC**

2025 sf

Climate Zone 4

Energy Efficiency Measures	Change Type	Incremental Cost Estimate		
		Min	Max	Avg
R-30 Roof w/ Radiant Barrier (from R-38 w/Radiant Barrier): 1,443 sf @ 0.15 to 0.20/sf	Downgrade	\$ (289)	\$ (216)	\$ (253)
R-19 Walls (from R-13): 2,550 sf @\$0.31 to \$0.54/sf	Upgrade	\$ 791	\$ 1,377	\$ 1,084
R-19 Raised Floor over Garage/Open at 2nd Floor	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
R-0 Slab on Grade	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Low E2 Vinyl Windows, U=0.36, SHGC=0.30	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Furnace: 80% AFUE	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Air Conditioner: None	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
R-4.2 Attic Ducts (from R-6)	Downgrade	\$ (325)	\$ (225)	\$ (275)
Reduced Duct Leakage/Testing (HERS)	Upgrade	\$ 300	\$ 600	\$ 450
50 Gallon Gas Water Heater: EF=0.62	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
<b>Total Incremental Cost of Energy Efficiency Measures:</b>		<b>\$ 477</b>	<b>\$ 1,536</b>	<b>\$ 1,006</b>
<b>Total Incremental Cost per Square Foot:</b>		<b>\$ 0.24</b>	<b>\$ 0.76</b>	<b>\$ 0.50</b>

#### **Incremental Cost Estimate to Exceed Title 24 by 15%** **Single Family Prototype: 2,025 SF, Option 2 - No AC**

2025 sf

Climate Zone 4

Energy Efficiency Measures	Change Type	Incremental Cost Estimate		
		Min	Max	Avg
R-38 Roof w/ Radiant Barrier	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
R-13 Walls	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
R-19 Raised Floor over Garage/Open at 2nd Floor	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
R-0 Slab on Grade	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Low E2 Vinyl Windows, U=0.36, SHGC=0.30	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Furnace: 92% AFUE (from 80% AFUE)	Upgrade	\$ 500	\$ 1,200	\$ 850
Air Conditioner: None	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
R-8 Attic Ducts (from R-6)	Upgrade	\$ 225	\$ 325	\$ 275
Reduced Duct Leakage/Testing (HERS)	Upgrade	\$ 300	\$ 600	\$ 450
50 Gallon Gas Water Heater: EF=0.62	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
<b>Total Incremental Cost of Energy Efficiency Measures:</b>		<b>\$ 1,025</b>	<b>\$ 2,125</b>	<b>\$ 1,575</b>
<b>Total Incremental Cost per Square Foot:</b>		<b>\$ 0.51</b>	<b>\$ 1.05</b>	<b>\$ 0.78</b>

**Incremental Cost Estimate to Exceed Title 24 by 15%**  
**Single Family Prototype: 2,025 SF, Option 3 with AC**

2025 sf

Climate Zone 4

Energy Efficiency Measures	Change Type	Incremental Cost Estimate		
		Min	Max	Avg
R-38 Roof w/ Radiant Barrier	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
R-19 Walls (from R-13): 2,550 sf @\$0.31 to \$0.54/sf	Upgrade	\$ 791	\$ 1,377	\$ 1,084
R-30 Raised Floor over Garage/Open at 2nd Floor (from R-19): 448 sf @ \$0.25 to \$0.35	Upgrade	\$ 112	\$ 157	\$ 134
R-0 Slab on Grade	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Low E2 Vinyl Windows, U=0.36, SHGC=0.30	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Furnace: 80% AFUE	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Air Conditioner: 13 SEER, 11 EER (HERS)	Upgrade	\$ 25	\$ 75	\$ 50
Air Conditioner: Refrig. Charge (HERS)	Upgrade	\$ 150	\$ 200	\$ 175
R-8 Attic Ducts (from R-6)	Upgrade	\$ 225	\$ 325	\$ 275
50 Gallon Gas Water Heater: EF=0.63 (from EF=0.62)	Upgrade	\$ -	\$ 50	\$ 25
<b>Total Incremental Cost of Energy Efficiency Measures:</b>		<b>\$ 1,303</b>	<b>\$ 2,184</b>	<b>\$ 1,743</b>
<b>Total Incremental Cost per Square Foot:</b>		<b>\$ 0.64</b>	<b>\$ 1.08</b>	<b>\$ 0.86</b>

**Incremental Cost Estimate to Exceed Title 24 by 15%**  
**Single Family Prototype: 2,025 SF, Option 4 with AC**

2025 sf

Climate Zone 4

Energy Efficiency Measures	Change Type	Incremental Cost Estimate		
		Min	Max	Avg
R-30 Roof w/ Radiant Barrier (from R-38 w/Radiant Barrier): 1,443 sf @ 0.15 to 0.20/sf	Downgrade	\$ (289)	\$ (216)	\$ (253)
R-21 Walls (from R-13): 2,550 sf @ \$0.45 to \$0.70/sf	Upgrade	\$ 1,148	\$ 1,785	\$ 1,466
R-30 Raised Floor over Garage/Open at 2nd Floor (from R-19): 448 sf @ \$0.25 to \$0.35	Upgrade	\$ 112	\$ 157	\$ 134
R-0 Slab on Grade	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Low E2 Vinyl Windows, U=0.36, SHGC=0.30	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Furnace: 80% AFUE	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Air Conditioner: 13 SEER	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
R-8 Attic Ducts (from R-6)	Upgrade	\$ 225	\$ 325	\$ 275
50 Gallon Gas Water Heater: EF=0.62	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
<b>Total Incremental Cost of Energy Efficiency Measures:</b>		<b>\$ 1,196</b>	<b>\$ 2,050</b>	<b>\$ 1,623</b>
<b>Total Incremental Cost per Square Foot:</b>		<b>\$ 0.59</b>	<b>\$ 1.01</b>	<b>\$ 0.80</b>

## Large Single Family House

- 4,500 square feet
- 2-story
- 22.0% glazing/floor area ratio

### **Incremental Cost Estimate to Exceed Title 24 by 15%** **Single Family Prototype: 4,500 SF, Option 1 - No AC**

4500 sf

Climate Zone 4

Energy Efficiency Measures	Change Type	Incremental Cost Estimate		
		Min	Max	Avg
R-38 Roof w/ Radiant Barrier	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
R-21 Walls (from R-13): 2,518 sf @ \$0.45 to \$0.70/sf	Upgrade	\$ 1,133	\$ 1,763	\$ 1,448
R-30 Raised Floor (from R-19): 2,700 sf @ \$0.25 to \$0.35	Upgrade	\$ 675	\$ 945	\$ 810
Low E2 Vinyl Windows, U=0.36, SHGC=0.30	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
(2) Furnaces: 80% AFUE	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Air Conditioner: None	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
R-8 Attic Ducts (from R-6)	Upgrade	\$ 450	\$ 650	\$ 550
Reduced Duct Leakage/Testing (HERS)	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
(2) 50 Gallon Gas Water Heaters: EF=0.63 (from EF=0.62)	Upgrade	\$ -	\$ 100	\$ 50
Pipe Insulation	Upgrade	\$ 300	\$ 400	\$ 350
<b>Total Incremental Cost of Energy Efficiency Measures:</b>		<b>\$ 2,558</b>	<b>\$ 3,858</b>	<b>\$ 3,208</b>
<b>Total Incremental Cost per Square Foot:</b>		<b>\$ 0.57</b>	<b>\$ 0.86</b>	<b>\$ 0.71</b>

### **Incremental Cost Estimate to Exceed Title 24 by 15%** **Single Family Prototype: 4,500 SF, Option 2 - No AC**

4500 sf

Climate Zone 4

Energy Efficiency Measures	Change Type	Incremental Cost Estimate		
		Min	Max	Avg
R-38 Roof w/ Radiant Barrier	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
R-19 Walls (from R-13): 2,518 sf @ \$0.31 to \$0.54/sf	Upgrade	\$ 781	\$ 1,360	\$ 1,070
R-19 Raised Floor	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Low E2 Vinyl Windows, U=0.36, SHGC=0.30	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
(2) Furnaces: 92% AFUE (from 80% AFUE)	Upgrade	\$ 1,000	\$ 2,400	\$ 1,700
Air Conditioner: None	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
R-6 Attic Ducts	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Reduced Duct Leakage/Testing (HERS)	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
(2) 50 Gallon Gas Water Heaters: EF=0.63 (from EF=0.62)	Upgrade	\$ -	\$ 100	\$ 50
<b>Total Incremental Cost of Energy Efficiency Measures:</b>		<b>\$ 1,781</b>	<b>\$ 3,860</b>	<b>\$ 2,820</b>
<b>Total Incremental Cost per Square Foot:</b>		<b>\$ 0.40</b>	<b>\$ 0.86</b>	<b>\$ 0.63</b>

**Incremental Cost Estimate to Exceed Title 24 by 15%**  
**Single Family Prototype: 4,500 SF, Option 3 with AC**

4500 sf

Climate Zone 4

<b>Energy Efficiency Measures</b>	<b>Change</b>	<b>Incremental Cost Estimate</b>		
R-30 Roof w/ Radiant Barrier (from R-38 w/ Radiant Barrier): 2,700 sf @ 0.15 to 0.20/sf	Downgrade	\$ (540)	\$ (405)	\$ (473)
R-19 Walls (from R-13): 2,518 sf @ \$0.31 to \$0.54/sf	Upgrade	\$ 781	\$ 1,360	\$ 1,070
R-19 Raised Floor	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Low E2 Vinyl Windows, U=0.36, SHGC=0.30	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
(2) Furnaces: 80% AFUE	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Air Conditioner: 13 SEER, 11 EER (HERS)	Upgrade	\$ 50	\$ 150	\$ 100
R-4.2 Attic Ducts (from R-6)	Downgrade	\$ (450)	\$ (650)	\$ (550)
Reduced Duct Leakage/Testing (HERS)	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
(2) Instantaneous Gas Water Heaters: RE=0.80 (from 50 Gal Gas: EF=0.62)	Upgrade	\$ 1,800	\$ 3,000	\$ 2,400
<b>Total Incremental Cost of Energy Efficiency Measures:</b>		<b>\$ 1,641</b>	<b>\$ 3,455</b>	<b>\$ 2,548</b>
<b>Total Incremental Cost per Square Foot:</b>		<b>\$ 0.36</b>	<b>\$ 0.77</b>	<b>\$ 0.57</b>

**Incremental Cost Estimate to Exceed Title 24 by 15%**  
**Single Family Prototype: 4,500 SF, Option 4 with AC**

4500 sf

Climate Zone 4

<b>Energy Efficiency Measures</b>	<b>Change</b>	<b>Incremental Cost Estimate</b>		
R-38 Roof w/ Radiant Barrier	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
R-15 Walls (from R-13): 2,518 sf @ \$0.14 to \$0.18/sf	Upgrade	\$ 353	\$ 453	\$ 403
R-30 Raised Floor (from R-19): 2,700 sf @ \$0.25 to \$0.35	Upgrade	\$ 675	\$ 945	\$ 810
Low E2 Vinyl Windows, U=0.36, SHGC=0.30	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
(2) Furnaces: 80% AFUE	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Air Conditioner: 13 SEER, 11 EER (HERS)	Upgrade	\$ 50	\$ 150	\$ 100
R-6 Attic Ducts	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Reduced Duct Leakage/Testing (HERS)	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
(2) Instantaneous Gas Water Heaters: RE=0.82 (from 50 Gal Gas: EF=0.62)	Upgrade	\$ 2,200	\$ 3,600	\$ 2,900
<b>Total Incremental Cost of Energy Efficiency Measures:</b>		<b>\$ 3,278</b>	<b>\$ 5,148</b>	<b>\$ 4,213</b>
<b>Total Incremental Cost per Square Foot:</b>		<b>\$ 0.73</b>	<b>\$ 1.14</b>	<b>\$ 0.94</b>

### Low-rise Multi-family Apartments

- 8,442 square feet
- 8 units/2-story
- 12.5% glazing/floor area ratio

#### **Incremental Cost Estimate to Exceed Title 24 by 15%**

**Multi-Family Prototype: 8,442 SF, Option 1 - No AC**

**8442 sf**

**Climate Zone 4**

Energy Efficiency Measures	Change Type	Incremental Cost Estimate		
		Min	Max	Avg
R-30 Roof w/ Radiant Barrier (from R-19 w/Radiant Barrier): 4,221 sf @ 0.25 to 0.35/sf	Upgrade	\$ 1,055	\$ 1,477	\$ 1,266
R-21 Walls (from R-13 ): 10,146 sf @ \$0.45 to \$0.70/sf	Upgrade	\$ 4,566	\$ 7,102	\$ 5,834
R-0 Slab on Grade	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Low E2 Vinyl, U=0.36, SHGC=0.30	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
(8) Furnaces: 80% AFUE	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Air Conditioner: None	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
R-6 Attic Ducts	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
(8) 40 Gallon Gas Water Heaters: EF=0.63	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
<b>Total Incremental Cost of Energy Efficiency Measures:</b>		<b>\$ 5,621</b>	<b>\$ 8,580</b>	<b>\$ 7,100</b>
<b>Total Incremental Cost per Square Foot:</b>		<b>\$ 0.67</b>	<b>\$ 1.02</b>	<b>\$ 0.84</b>

#### **Incremental Cost Estimate to Exceed Title 24 by 15%**

**Multi-Family Prototype: 8,442 SF, Option 2 - No AC**

**8442 sf**

**Climate Zone 4**

Energy Efficiency Measures	Change Type	Incremental Cost Estimate		
		Min	Max	Avg
R-19 Roof w/ Radiant Barrier	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
R-19 Walls (from R-13 ): 10,146 sf @ \$0.31 to \$0.54/sf	Upgrade	\$ 3,145	\$ 5,479	\$ 4,312
R-0 Slab on Grade	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Low E2 Vinyl, U=0.36, SHGC=0.30	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
(8) Furnaces: 80% AFUE	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Air Conditioner: None	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
R-4.2 Attic Ducts (from R-6)	Downgrade	\$ (1,600)	\$ (1,000)	\$ (1,300)
Reduced Duct Leakage/Testing (HERS)	Upgrade	\$ 2,400	\$ 4,800	\$ 3,600
(8) 40 Gallon Gas Water Heaters: EF=0.62 (from EF=0.63)	Downgrade	\$ (400)	\$ -	\$ (200)
<b>Total Incremental Cost of Energy Efficiency Measures:</b>		<b>\$ 3,545</b>	<b>\$ 9,279</b>	<b>\$ 6,412</b>
<b>Total Incremental Cost per Square Foot:</b>		<b>\$ 0.42</b>	<b>\$ 1.10</b>	<b>\$ 0.76</b>

**Incremental Cost Estimate to Exceed Title 24 by 15%**  
**Multi-Family Prototype: 8,442 SF, Option 3 with AC**

8442 sf

Climate Zone 4

Energy Efficiency Measures	Change Type	Incremental Cost Estimate		
		Min	Max	Avg
R-19 Roof w/ Radiant Barrier	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
R-21 Walls (from R-13 ): 10,146 sf @ \$0.45 to \$0.70/sf	Upgrade	\$ 4,566	\$ 7,102	\$ 5,834
R-0 Slab on Grade	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Low E2 Vinyl, U=0.36, SHGC=0.30	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
(8) Furnaces: 80% AFUE	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
(8) Air Conditioners: 13 SEER, 11 EER (HERS)	Upgrade	\$ 200	\$ 600	\$ 400
(8) Air Conditioner: Refrig. Charge (HERS)	Upgrade	\$ 1,200	\$ 1,600	\$ 1,400
R-8 Attic Ducts (from R-6)	Upgrade	\$ 1,000	\$ 1,600	\$ 1,300
(8) 40 Gallon Gas Water Heaters: EF=0.63	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
<b>Total Incremental Cost of Energy Efficiency Measures:</b>		<b>\$ 6,966</b>	<b>\$ 10,902</b>	<b>\$ 8,934</b>
<b>Total Incremental Cost per Square Foot:</b>		<b>\$ 0.83</b>	<b>\$ 1.29</b>	<b>\$ 1.06</b>

**Incremental Cost Estimate to Exceed Title 24 by 15%**  
**Multi-Family Prototype: 8,442 SF, Option 4 with AC**

8442 sf

Climate Zone 4

Energy Efficiency Measures	Change Type	Incremental Cost Estimate		
		Min	Max	Avg
R-19 Roof w/ Radiant Barrier	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
R-19 Walls (from R-13 ): 10,146 sf @ \$0.31 to \$0.54/sf	Upgrade	\$ 3,145	\$ 5,479	\$ 4,312
R-0 Slab on Grade	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Low E2 Vinyl, U=0.36, SHGC=0.30	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
(8) Furnace: 92% AFUE (from 80% AFUE)	Upgrade	\$ 4,000	\$ 9,600	\$ 6,800
Air Conditioner: None	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
R-4.2 Attic Ducts (from R-6)	Downgrade	\$ (1,600)	\$ (1,000)	\$ (1,300)
(8) 40 Gallon Gas Water Heaters: EF=0.63	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
<b>Total Incremental Cost of Energy Efficiency Measures:</b>		<b>\$ 5,545</b>	<b>\$ 14,079</b>	<b>\$ 9,812</b>
<b>Total Incremental Cost per Square Foot:</b>		<b>\$ 0.66</b>	<b>\$ 1.67</b>	<b>\$ 1.16</b>

## High-rise Multifamily Apartments

- 36,800 sf,
- 40 units/4-story
- Window to Wall Ratio = 31.6%

### Incremental Cost Estimate to Exceed Title 24 by 15% High-rise Residential Prototype: 36,800 SF, Option 1

Climate Zone 4

Energy Efficiency Measures to Exceed Title 24 by 15%	Change Type	Incremental Cost Estimate		
		Min	Max	Avg
R-19 Metal Roof w/ R-30 batt insulation below; Cool Roof Reflectance=0.55, Emittance=0.75; 9,200 sf @ \$0.50 - \$0.70/sf	Upgrade	\$ 4,600	\$ 6,440	\$ 5,520
R-19 in Metal Frame Walls	-			
R-4 (1.25" K-13 spray-on) Raised Slab over parking garage	-			
Dual Metal Windows: COG U-factor=0.30, COG SHGC=0.31 6,240 sf @ \$1.00 to \$1.50/sf	Upgrade	\$ 6,240	\$ 9,360	\$ 7,800
1.5 ton 4-pipe fan coils, 98% AFUE boiler, 70-ton scroll air cooled chiller 0.72 KW/ton	Upgrade	\$ 2,500	\$ 4,000	\$ 3,250
Central DHW boiler: 98% AFUE and recirculating system w/ timer-temperature controls	Upgrade	\$ 2,500	\$ 4,000	\$ 3,250
<b>Total Incremental Cost of Energy Efficiency Measures:</b>		<b>\$ 15,840</b>	<b>\$ 23,800</b>	<b>\$ 19,820</b>
<b>Total Incremental Cost per Square Foot:</b>		<b>\$ 0.43</b>	<b>\$ 0.65</b>	<b>\$ 0.54</b>

### Incremental Cost Estimate to Exceed Title 24 by 15% High-rise Residential Prototype: 36,800 SF, Option 2

Climate Zone 4

Energy Efficiency Measures to Exceed Title 24 by 15%	Change Type	Incremental Cost Estimate		
		Min	Max	Avg
R-19 Metal Roof w/ R-19 batt insulation below; Cool Roof Reflectance=0.55, Emittance=0.75; 9,200 sf @ \$0.35 - \$0.50/sf	Upgrade	\$ 3,220	\$ 4,600	\$ 3,910
R-19 in Metal Frame Walls	-			
R-4 (1.25" K-13 spray-on) Raised Slab over parking garage	-			
Dual Metal Windows: COG U-factor=0.3, COG SHGC=0.27 6,240 sf @ \$1.50 to \$2.50/sf	Upgrade	\$ 9,360	\$ 23,000	\$ 16,180
1.5 ton 4-pipe fan coils, 98% AFUE boiler, 70-ton scroll air cooled chiller 0.72 KW/ton	Upgrade	\$ 2,500	\$ 4,000	\$ 3,250
Central DHW boiler: 98% AFUE and recirculating system w/ timer-temperature controls	Upgrade	\$ 2,500	\$ 4,000	\$ 3,250
<b>Total Incremental Cost of Energy Efficiency Measures:</b>		<b>\$ 17,580</b>	<b>\$ 35,600</b>	<b>\$ 26,590</b>
<b>Total Incremental Cost per Square Foot:</b>		<b>\$ 0.48</b>	<b>\$ 0.97</b>	<b>\$ 0.72</b>

**Incremental Cost Estimate to Exceed Title 24 by 15%**  
**High-rise Residential Prototype: 36,800 SF, Option 3**

**Climate Zone 4**

<b>Energy Efficiency Measures to Exceed Title 24 by 15%</b>	<b>Change Type</b>	<b>Incremental Cost Estimate</b>		
		<b>Min</b>	<b>Max</b>	<b>Avg</b>
R-19 Metal Roof w/ <b>R-30 batt insulation below; Cool Roof Reflectance=0.55, Emittance=0.75</b> ; 9,200 sf @ \$0.50 - \$0.70/sf	Upgrade	\$ 4,600	\$ 6,440	\$ 5,520
R-19 in Metal Frame Walls	-			
R-4 (1.25" K-13 spray-on) Raised Slab over parking garage	-			
Dual Metal Windows: COG U-factor=0.3, <b>COG SHGC=0.27</b> 6,240 sf @ \$1.50 to \$2.50/sf	Upgrade	\$ 9,360	\$ 23,000	\$ 16,180
1.5 ton 4-pipe fan coils, <b>94% AFUE boiler</b> , 70-ton scroll air cooled chiller 0.72 KW/ton	Upgrade	\$ 1,500	\$ 2,500	\$ 2,000
Central DHW boiler: <b>94% AFUE</b> and recirculating system w/ timer-temperature controls	Upgrade	\$ 1,500	\$ 2,500	\$ 2,000
<b>Total Incremental Cost of Energy Efficiency Measures:</b>		<b>\$ 16,960</b>	<b>\$ 34,440</b>	<b>\$ 25,700</b>
<b>Total Incremental Cost per Square Foot:</b>		<b>\$ 0.46</b>	<b>\$ 0.94</b>	<b>\$ 0.70</b>

## Low-rise Office Building

- Single Story
- 10,580 sf,
- Window to Wall Ratio = 37.1%

### Incremental Cost Estimate to Exceed Title 24 by 15% Nonresidential Prototype: 10,580 SF, Option 1

Climate Zone 4

Energy Efficiency Measures to Exceed Title 24 by 15%	Change Type	Incremental Cost Estimate		
		Min	Max	Avg
R-19 Metal Roof w/ <b>R-22 batt insulation below</b> ; 10,580 sf @ \$0.10 - \$0.15/sf	Upgrade	\$ 1,058	\$ 1,587	\$ 1,323
R-19 in Metal Frame Walls	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
R-0 (un-insulated) slab-on-grade 1st floor	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Metal windows: <b>COG U=0.30, COG SHGC=0.54</b> ; 3,200 sf @ \$1.50 to \$2.50/sf	Upgrade	\$ 4,800	\$ 8,000	\$ 6,400
Lighting = 0.692 w/sf: Open Office Areas: <b>(32) 2-lamp T8 fixtures @74w each</b> ; no lighting controls; (24) 18w recessed CFLs. Small Offices: (56) 2-lamp T8 fixtures, <b>(28) multi-level occupancy sensors @ \$75 to \$100 each</b> ; (40) 18w recessed CFLs. Support Areas: (32) 18w recessed CFLs; (48) 13w CFL wall sconces; no controls.	Upgrade	\$ 820	\$ 1,648	\$ 1,234
(2) 13-ton DX units EER=11.6; 82% AFUE furnaces; standard efficiency fan motors; fixed temp. integrated air economizers	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
<b>R-8</b> duct insulation w/ ducts on roof, HERS verified duct leakage	Upgrade	\$ 100	\$ 250	\$ 175
(1) 50 gallon or less tank Gas Water Heaters EF=0.58	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
<b>Total Incremental Cost of Energy Efficiency Measures:</b>		<b>\$ 6,778</b>	<b>\$ 11,485</b>	<b>\$ 9,132</b>
<b>Total Incremental Cost per Square Foot:</b>		<b>\$ 0.64</b>	<b>\$ 1.09</b>	<b>\$ 0.86</b>

**Incremental Cost Estimate to Exceed Title 24 by 15%**  
**Nonresidential Prototype: 10,580 SF, Option 2**

**Climate Zone 4**

Energy Efficiency Measures to Exceed Title 24 by 15%	Change Type	Incremental Cost Estimate		
		Min	Max	Avg
R-19 Metal Roof w/R-19 batt below; <b>Cool Roof Reflectance=0.55, Emittance=0.75;</b> 10,580 sf @ \$0.35 - \$0.50/sf	Upgrade	\$ 3,703	\$ 5,290	\$ 4,497
R-19 in Metal Frame Walls	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
R-0 (un-insulated) slab-on-grade 1st floor	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Metal windows: <b>COG U=0.30, COG SHGC=0.38;</b> 3,200 sf @ \$1.50 to \$3.00/sf	Upgrade	\$ 4,800	\$ 9,600	\$ 7,200
Lighting = 0.858 w/sf: Open Office Areas: (60) 2-lamp T8 fixtures @58w each; (24) 18w recessed CFLs no lighting controls. Small Offices: (48) 2-lamp T8 fixtures; (40) 18w recessed CFLs, no controls. Support Areas: (32) 18w recessed CFLs; (48) 13w CFL wall sconces; no controls.	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
(2) 13-ton DX units EER=11.6; 82% AFUE furnaces; standard efficiency fan motors; fixed temp. integrated air economizers	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
R-6 duct insulation w/ ducts on roof, HERS verified duct leakage	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
(1) 50 gallon or less tank Gas Water Heaters EF=0.58	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
<b>Total Incremental Cost of Energy Efficiency Measures:</b>		<b>\$ 8,503</b>	<b>\$ 14,890</b>	<b>\$ 11,697</b>
<b>Total Incremental Cost per Square Foot:</b>		<b>\$ 0.80</b>	<b>\$ 1.41</b>	<b>\$ 1.11</b>

**Incremental Cost Estimate to Exceed Title 24 by 15%**

**Nonresidential Prototype: 10,580 SF, Option 3**

**Climate Zone 4**

Energy Efficiency Measures to Exceed Title 24 by 15%	Change Type	Incremental Cost Estimate		
		Min	Max	Avg
R-19 Metal Roof w/ <b>R-25 batt insulation below; Cool Roof Reflectance=0.55, Emittance=0.75;</b> 10,580 sf @ \$0.55 - \$0.80/sf	Upgrade	\$ 5,819	\$ 8,464	\$ 7,142
R-19 in Metal Frame Walls	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
R-0 (un-insulated) slab-on-grade 1st floor	-	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Metal windows: <b>COG U=0.30, COG SHGC=0.54;</b> 3,200 sf @ \$1.50 to \$2.50/sf	Upgrade	\$ 4,800	\$ 8,000	\$ 6,400
Lighting = 0.783 w/sf. Open Office Areas: (60) 2-lamp T8 fixtures @58w each; no lighting controls; (24) 18w recessed CFLs. Small Offices: (56) 2-lamp T8 fixtures, <b>(28) multi-level occupancy sensors @ \$75 to \$100 each;</b> (40) 18w recessed CFLs. Support Areas: (32) 18w recessed CFLs; (48) 13w CFL wall sconces; no controls.	Upgrade	\$ 2,100	\$ 2,800	\$ 2,450
(2) 13-ton DX units EER=11.6; 82% AFUE furnaces; standard efficiency fan motors; fixed temp. integrated air economizers	-			
<b>R-8</b> duct insulation w/ ducts on roof, HERS verified duct leakage	Upgrade	\$ 100	\$ 250	\$ 175
<b>(1) tankless Gas Water Heaters EF=0.84</b>	Upgrade	\$ 1,400	\$ 2,200	\$ 1,800
<b>Total Incremental Cost of Energy Efficiency Measures:</b>		<b>\$ 14,219</b>	<b>\$ 21,714</b>	<b>\$ 17,967</b>
<b>Total Incremental Cost per Square Foot:</b>		<b>\$ 1.34</b>	<b>\$ 2.05</b>	<b>\$ 1.70</b>

## High-rise Office Building

- 5-story
- 52,900 sf,
- Window to Wall Ratio = 34.5%

### Incremental Cost Estimate to Exceed Title 24 by 15%

#### Nonresidential Prototype: 52,900 SF, Option 1

Climate Zone 4

Energy Efficiency Measures to Exceed Title 24 by 15%	Change Type	Incremental Cost Estimate		
		Min	Max	Avg
R-19 Metal Roof w/ R-19 batt below; 10,580 sf @ \$0.35 - \$0.50/sf	Upgrade	\$ 3,703	\$ 5,290	\$ 4,497
R-19 in Metal Frame Walls	-	-	-	-
R-0 (un-insulated) slab-on-grade 1st floor	-	-	-	-
Metal windows: <b>COG U=0.30, COG SHGC=0.38</b> ; 16,000 sf @ \$1.50 to \$3.00/sf	Upgrade	\$ 24,000	\$ 48,000	\$ 36,000
Lighting = 0.858 w/sf: Open Office Areas: (300) 2-lamp T8 fixtures @58w each; no lighting controls; (120) 18w recessed CFLs no lighting controls. Small Offices: (280) 2-lamp T8 fixtures on/off lighting controls; (200) 18w recessed CFLs no lighting controls. Support Areas: (160) 18w recessed CFLs no lighting controls; (240) 13w CFL wall sconces; no lighting controls.	-	-	-	-
(4) 55-ton Packaged VAV EER=10.1; 80% TE furnaces; standard efficiency variable speed fan motors; <b>Fixed temp. integrated air economizers</b> ; 15% VAV boxes, electric reheat on perim. zones	Upgrade	\$ 8,000	\$ 12,000	\$ 10,000
R-6 duct insulation w/ ducts in conditioned	-	-	-	-
Standard Tank Gas Water Heaters EF=0.58	-	-	-	-
<b>Total Incremental Cost of Energy Efficiency Measures:</b>		<b>\$ 35,703</b>	<b>\$ 65,290</b>	<b>\$ 50,497</b>
<b>Total Incremental Cost per Square Foot:</b>		<b>\$ 0.67</b>	<b>\$ 1.23</b>	<b>\$ 0.95</b>

**Incremental Cost Estimate to Exceed Title 24 by 15%**  
**Nonresidential Prototype: 52,900 SF, Option 2**

**Climate Zone 4**

<b>Energy Efficiency Measures to Exceed Title 24 by 15%</b>	<b>Change Type</b>	<b>Incremental Cost Estimate</b>		
		<b>Min</b>	<b>Max</b>	<b>Avg</b>
R-19 Metal Roof; no cool roof	-	-	-	-
R-19 in Metal Frame Walls	-	-	-	-
R-0 (un-insulated) slab-on-grade 1st floor	-	-	-	-
Metal windows: <b>COG U=0.30, COG SHGC=0.38</b> ; 16,000 sf @ \$1.50 to \$3.00/sf	Upgrade	\$ 24,000	\$ 48,000	\$ 36,000
Lighting = 0.783 w/sf: Open Office Areas: (300) 2-lamp T8 fixtures @58w each; no lighting controls; (120) 18w recessed CFLs no lighting controls;. Small Offices: <b>(280) 2-lamp T8 fixtures with 140 multi-level sensors; @ \$75 to \$100 each</b> ; (200) 18w recessed CFLs, with multi-level sensors. Support Areas: (160) 18w recessed CFLs; (240) 13w CFL wall sconces; no lighting controls.	Upgrade	\$ 10,500	\$ 14,000	\$ 12,250
(4) 55-ton Packaged VAV EER=10.1; 80% TE furnaces; standard efficiency variable speed fan motors; no air economizers; 15% VAV boxes, electric reheat on perimeter zones	Upgrade	\$ 8,000	\$ 12,000	\$ 10,000
R-6 duct insulation w/ ducts in conditioned	-	-	-	-
Standard Tank Gas Water Heaters EF=0.58	-	-	-	-
<b>Total Incremental Cost of Energy Efficiency Measures:</b>		<b>\$ 42,500</b>	<b>\$ 74,000</b>	<b>\$ 58,250</b>
<b>Total Incremental Cost per Square Foot:</b>		<b>\$ 0.80</b>	<b>\$ 1.40</b>	<b>\$ 1.10</b>

**Incremental Cost Estimate to Exceed Title 24 by 15%**  
**Nonresidential Prototype: 52,900 SF, Option 3**

**Climate Zone 4**

Energy Efficiency Measures to Exceed Title 24 by 15%	Change Type	Incremental Cost Estimate		
		Min	Max	Avg
R-19 Metal Roof w/R-19 batt below; Cool Roof Reflectance=0.55, Emittance=0.75; 10,580 sf @ \$0.70 - \$1.00/sf	Upgrade	\$ 7,406	\$ 10,580	\$ 8,993
R-21 in Metal Frame Walls; 24,580 sf @ 0.10 - \$0.15/sf	Upgrade	\$ 2,458	\$ 3,687	\$ 3,073
R-0 (un-insulated) slab-on-grade 1st floor	-	-	-	-
Metal windows: COG U=0.30, COG SHGC=0.54; 16,000 sf @ \$1.00 to \$2.00/sf	Upgrade	\$ 16,000	\$ 32,000	\$ 24,000
Lighting = 0.783 w/sf: Open Office Areas: (300) 2-lamp T8 fixtures @58w each; no lighting controls; (120) 18w recessed CFLs no lighting controls;. Small Offices: (280) 2-lamp T8 fixtures with 140 multi-level sensors; @ \$75 to \$100 each; (200) 18w recessed CFLs, with multi-level sensors. Support Areas: (160) 18w recessed CFLs; (240) 13w CFL wall sconces; no controls.	Upgrade	\$ 10,500	\$ 14,000	\$ 12,250
(4) 55-ton Packaged VAV EER=10.1; 80% TE furnaces; standard efficiency variable speed fan motors; no air economizers; 15% VAV boxes, electric reheat on perimeter zones	-	-	-	-
R-6 duct insulation w/ ducts in conditioned	-	-	-	-
Standard Tank Gas Water Heaters EF=0.62	Upgrade	\$ 750	\$ 1,500	\$ 1,125
<b>Total Incremental Cost of Energy Efficiency Measures:</b>		<b>\$ 37,114</b>	<b>\$ 61,767</b>	<b>\$ 49,441</b>
<b>Total Incremental Cost per Square Foot:</b>		<b>\$ 0.70</b>	<b>\$ 1.17</b>	<b>\$ 0.93</b>

## **5.0 Cost -Effectiveness Determination**

Regardless of the building design, occupancy profile and number of stories, the incremental improvement in overall annual energy performance of buildings in exceeding the 2008 Standards is determined to be cost-effective. However, each building's overall design, occupancy type and specific design choices may allow for a large range of incremental costs for exceeding 2008 Standards, estimated annual energy cost savings, and subsequent payback period.

### **Small Single Family**

<b>Building Description</b>	<b>Total Annual KWh Saving</b>	<b>Total Annual Therms Saving</b>	<b>Incremental First Cost (\$)</b>	<b>Annual Energy Cost Savings (\$)</b>	<b>Simple Payback (Years)</b>
2,025 sf (Option 1)	208	79	\$1,007	\$128	7.8
2,025 sf (Option 2)	99	93	\$1,575	\$125	12.6
2,025 sf (Option 3)	212	74	\$1,744	\$123	14.1
2,025 sf (Option 4)	212	77	\$1,623	\$127	12.8
<b>Averages:</b>	<b>183</b>	<b>81</b>	<b>\$1,487</b>	<b>\$126</b>	<b>11.9</b>

*Annual Reduction in CO2-equivalent: 0.50 lb./sq.ft.-year; 1,022 lb./building-year  
Increased Cost / lb. CO2-e reduction: \$1.45*

### **Large Single Family**

<b>Building Description</b>	<b>Total Annual KWh Saving</b>	<b>Total Annual Therms Saving</b>	<b>Incremental First Cost (\$)</b>	<b>Annual Energy Cost Savings (\$)</b>	<b>Simple Payback (Years)</b>
4,500 sf (Option 1)	320	100	\$3,208	\$173	18.6
4,500 sf (Option 2)	228	113	\$2,821	\$171	16.5
4,500 sf (Option 3)	140	130	\$2,548	\$175	14.6
4,500 sf (Option 4)	87	140	\$4,213	\$177	23.8
<b>Averages:</b>	<b>194</b>	<b>121</b>	<b>\$3,197</b>	<b>\$174</b>	<b>18.4</b>

*Annual Reduction in CO2-equivalent: 0.33 lb./sq.ft.-year; 1,493 lb./building-year  
Increased Cost / lb. CO2-e reduction: \$2.14*

### Low-rise Multi-family Apartments

Building Description	Total Annual KWh Saving	Total Annual Therms Saving	Incremental First Cost (\$)	Annual Energy Cost Savings (\$)	Simple Payback (Years)
8-Unit, 8,442 sf (Option 1)	1023	283	\$7,101	\$510	13.9
8-Unit, 8,442 sf (Option 2)	998	286	\$6,412	\$509	12.6
8-Unit, 8,442 sf (Option 3)	1015	264	\$8,934	\$486	18.4
8-Unit, 8,442 sf (Option 4)	718	312	\$9,812	\$488	20.1
<b>Averages:</b>	<b>939</b>	<b>286</b>	<b>\$8,065</b>	<b>\$498</b>	<b>16.3</b>

*Annual Reduction in CO2-equivalent: 0.44 lb./sq.ft.-year; 3,754 lb./building-year  
Increased Cost / lb. CO2-e reduction: \$2.15*

### High-rise Multi-family Apartments

Building Description	Total Annual KWh Saving	Total Annual Therms Saving	Incremental First Cost (\$)	Annual Energy Cost Savings (\$)	Simple Payback (Years)
36,800 sf (Option 1)	12335	550	\$19,820	\$9,654	2.1
36,800 sf (Option 2)	13670	362	\$26,590	\$2,877	9.2
36,800 sf (Option 3)	13744	150	\$25,700	\$2,646	9.7
<b>Averages:</b>	<b>13250</b>	<b>354</b>	<b>\$24,037</b>	<b>\$5,059</b>	<b>7.0</b>

*Annual Reduction in CO2-equivalent: 0.27 lb./sq.ft.-year; 10,083 lb./building-year  
Increased Cost / lb. CO2-e reduction: \$2.38*

### Low-rise Office Building

Building Description	Total Annual KWh Saving	Total Annual Therms Saving	Incremental First Cost (\$)	Annual Energy Cost Savings (\$)	Simple Payback (Years)
10,580 sf (Option 1)	15208	-47	\$9,132	\$3,920	2.3
10,580 sf (Option 2)	16209	-166	\$11,697	\$4,197	2.8
10,580 sf (Option 3)	13474	110	\$17,967	\$3,745	4.8
<b>Averages:</b>	<b>14964</b>	<b>-34</b>	<b>\$12,932</b>	<b>\$3,954</b>	<b>3.3</b>

*Annual Reduction in CO2-equivalent: 0.60 lb./sq.ft.-year; 6,334 lb./building-year  
Increased Cost / lb. CO2-e reduction: \$2.04*

## High-rise Office Building

Building Description	Total Annual KWh Saving	Total Annual Therms Saving	Incremental First Cost (\$)	Annual Energy Cost Savings (\$)	Simple Payback (Years)
52,900 sf (Option 1)	93572	-2	\$50,497	\$19,811	2.5
52,900 sf (Option 2)	81081	-10	\$58,250	\$21,837	2.7
52,900 sf (Option 3)	74551	148	\$49,441	\$19,229	2.6
Averages:	83068	45	\$52,729	\$20,292	2.6

*Annual Reduction in CO2-equivalent: 0.72 lb./sq.ft.-year; 37,908 lb./building-year  
Increased Cost / lb. CO2-e reduction: \$1.39*

### Conclusions

Regardless of the building design, occupancy profile and number of stories, the incremental improvement in overall annual energy performance of buildings which exceed the 2008 Title 24 Building Energy Efficiency Standards by 15% appears cost-effective. However, each building's overall design, occupancy type and specific design choices may allow for a large range of incremental first cost and payback. As with simply meeting the requirements of the Title 24 energy standards, a permit applicant complying with the energy requirements of a green building ordinance should carefully analyze building energy performance to reduce incremental first cost and the payback for the required additional energy efficiency measures.