

Renewable Energy Transmission Initiative (RETI)
Final Minutes of Stakeholder Steering Committee Meeting
On November 24, 2008
Finalized on December 17, 2008

The RETI Stakeholder Steering Committee met at the California Public Utilities Commission in San Francisco on November 24, 2008, beginning at 10:00 AM. Eight members attended by WebEx, and the meeting was accessible to observers via WebEx. Attendees are listed below. Minutes were compiled by Dave Olsen of CEERT.

The committee took the following actions:

1. **Approved minutes, as revised.** Minutes of the November 14, 2008 SSC meeting were approved, with two edits. Discussion of the Twentynine Palms Marine Base Expansion (p. 2) was amended to specify that BLM had recommended that CREZ potentially affected by expansion of the base be included in RETI Phase 1 analysis. Summary of the photovoltaic thin-film sensitivity (p. 3) was amended to clarify that the discussion referred to distributed PV (as opposed to central-station PV).
2. **Agreed to create a standalone document explaining the RETI mandate and urgency of transmission development, in relation to possibilities for expanded reliance on energy efficiency and distributed generation.** RETI coordinators were directed to draft and circulate a statement addressing these issues to the SSC, for later posting on the RETI website.
3. **Edited the guidance document for RETI Phase 2.** After discussion, there was general agreement that the draft document be revised to add or clarify that:
 - Phase 2 planning should consider all CA CREZ;
 - conceptual planning to access Out of State resources will be conducted;
 - transmission cost estimates will be refined;
 - conceptual planning should emphasize a no-regrets approach consisting of upgrades likely to be needed in the largest number of development scenarios and capable of being able to be phased to accommodate development in different areas at different times; and that
 - prioritization of CREZ and supporting transmission should be deferred to the end of Phase 2, rather than being settled at the beginning of Phase 2.RETI coordinators were directed to revise the Phase 2 guidance document in time for discussion at the Dec. 3, 2008 Phase 2 work group meeting.
4. **Reviewed comments on the Black & Veatch/economic assessment section of the draft Phase 1B report and agreed to revisions.**
 - **Transmission cost:** Black & Veatch will do a sensitivity analysis in which all generating projects pay for transmission, including those in the Tehachapi, Riverside and Imperial County areas previously assumed to obtain transmission from the TRTP, DPV2 or Sunrise transmission projects. Black & Veatch will make its transmission model available and is willing to conduct a separate meeting to explain its use.

- **Deliverability:** Phase 2 Conceptual Planning work group may consider alternatives to simultaneous 100% delivery of nameplate rating of all generation in each CREZ.
- **Transmission lines through Black and Yellow areas:** Black & Veatch will add explanations that lines on maps in some CREZ are conceptual connections between substations and do not indicate routings; and that such lines could be routed around black-out areas without going through them.
- **Twentynine Palms Base Expansion:** Black & Veatch will add a new map showing the effect of excluding the land at issue from renewable energy development.
- **Lassen CREZ:** Black & Veatch will give shape files to CEERT, which will coordinate EWG re-ranking of this CREZ to match the corrected footprint.
- **Palm Springs CREZ:** report text to clarify that the wind project shown in the GIS file inside San Jacinto National Monument was grandfathered.
- **Baja wind; wind capacity value:** Wind industry to send 70-meter windspeed data to Black & Veatch, who will take another look at its resource assumptions for Baja and consider whether RETI should identify the resource there as larger than the 5,000 MW now in interconnection queues. Black & Veatch to check its calculation of wind capacity value.
- **PV Thin Film Sensitivity:** Black & Veatch will run a case using thin film as the base solar technology. If this causes CREZ to move, Black & Veatch will add a new bubble chart displaying the results.
- **Out of State (OOS) Resources:** Black & Veatch will add OOS resources to supply curve figures in the report. It will put lines on the bubble chart to indicate relative economic cost. (It cannot add bubbles, since OOS resources have no EWG ranking).
- **Uncertainty Bands:** Black & Veatch will assign a probability distribution to inputs; this will shrink the bands. Explanation of this issue to be expanded in the Executive Summary.
- **NREL Solar DNI data** is known to be inaccurate. The effect of this inaccuracy is captured in the uncertainty bands. B&V will add a footnote indicating that better data will soon be available.
- **CREZ labels.** Text or labels accompanying bubble chart will be added to indicate that CREZ generation shown is the theoretical maximum output.
- **Land ownership fragmentation.** B&V will add language calling attention to this issue as a potential obstacle to generation development in CREZ.
- **Explanation of CREZ adjustment in Phase 2.** Text to be added or expanded to better explain that boundaries and estimated generation potential of most or all CREZ will be altered as a result of Phase 2 ground-truthing.

5. **Reviewed comments on the EWG/environmental assessment section of the draft Phase 1B report.** Major categories of issues raised include:

- **EWG structure and process:** comments claim RETI schedule did not allow adequate time for public participation; that there was inadequate environmentalist representation on the EWG, and that the EWG was dominated by industry; that participants' ideas or information provided had been ignored; and that insufficient notice of EWG meetings had been provided.
- **RETI purpose and scope:** comments challenge the need for large-scale renewables and associated transmission.

- **Degraded lands:** RETI should do more to direct potential development to already disturbed lands.
- **Treatment of wind projects in EWG ratings:** the agreement negotiated between Dariush Shirmohammadi (wind industry) and Carl Zichella and Johanna Wald (EWG) should be reflected in the EWG section of the Phase 1B report. If this prior agreement must be reconsidered, RETI coordinators will convene the SSC by WebEx or e-mail to resolve any outstanding issues for inclusion in the final Phase 1B report.

6. Agreed on a process for reviewing the draft final Phase 1B report. Black & Veatch and the EWG will produce red-lined versions of their sections of the revised Phase 1B report, showing changes made in response to comments received and SSC discussion of the draft report; RETI coordinators will do the same for the Executive Summary. B&V and the EWG will also each produce a brief summary of comments received on their sections of the draft report, and a summary of responses to those comments, for inclusion in the final Phase 1B report. This red-line draft final report will be posted on the RETI website on Dec. 4.

SSC members may recommend specific language for further revising the red-line draft final report until Dec. 11, 2008. Black & Veatch and the EWG will consider such specific recommended edits in preparing the Phase 1B final report. The SSC will consider accepting the Phase 1B final report as the basis for continuing RETI work at its Dec. 17 meeting.

7. Agreed that the SSC should convene public meetings to explain Phase 2 work, beginning in January 2009. The Governor's Nov. 17 Executive Order helps explain the urgency of providing transmission to access renewables and RETI's compressed timeline, which has hampered public participation. At least some of these meetings should be held at night or on weekends to enable more people to attend.

8. Noted Phase 2 work group meeting schedule:

The overall Phase 2 work group, and the Conceptual Planning and CREZ Refinement work groups, will meet as follows:

- **December 3:** at CEC, Sacramento, 10:00 AM - 4:00 PM
- **December 18:** at CEC, Sacramento, 10:00 AM - 4:00 PM

9. Confirmed December 17 as the date of the next **SSC meeting**, at the CEC in Sacramento. Agenda: consider acceptance of the final Phase 1B report; set dates for public meetings to explain Phase 2 work.

The meeting was adjourned at 4:00 PM.

November 24, 2008 SSC meeting attendees

SSC members:

PG&E	Robert Jenkins, Kevin Dasso
SCE	Shashi Pandey (for Gary Tarplee); Gary Allen (WebEx)
SMUD	Mike DeAngelis

CAISO Robin Smutny-Jones; Gary DeShazo (WebEx)
LADWP Mohammed Beshir (WebEx)
NRDC Johanna Wald (WebEx)
USFS Julie Tupper; Mike Chapel (WebEx)
Sierra Club Carl Zichella (WebEx)
IEP Steven Kelly
Biomass Gregg Morris
Geothermal John McCaull (WebEx)
Solar Arthur Haubenstock
Wind Faramarz Nabavi
Counties Joe Bertotti
Farm Bureau Karen Mills
DRA David Peck; Scott Logan
CEC Clare Laufenberg Gallardo

Not Present:

BLM Bob Doyel (for Duane Marti/Jim Abbott)
Counties Andy Horne
CPUC Anne Gillette
IID Juan Carlos Sandoval
SCPPA Dave Walden
SDG&E Linda Brown, Mike McClenahan
NCPA Jim Pope
Military Tony Parisi
NAHC; BIA Dave Singleton

Coordinating Committee members attending:

CEC Chuck Najarian (WebEx)

B&V: Ryan Pletka

Observers:

CPUC Cheryl Lee
CalWEA Nancy Rader

WebEx Observers:

BLM Ashley Conrad-Saydeh
CEERT Ryan Drobek
Defenders DeAnn Albers
DRA Nika
DWR Mike Saghai
Sierra Club Joan Taylor
U.C. Lloyd Cibulka
Citizen John Moore; 5 unidentified call-in users

Coordinators:

Rich Ferguson, Dave Olsen – CEERT