

<b>DOCKET</b> 07-AFC-6
DATE FEB 09 2012
<b>RECD.</b> FEB 13 2012

State of California  
Energy Resources Conservation and  
Development Commission

In the Matter of:	)	
	)	Docket No.
The Application for Certification of the	)	07-AFC-6
Carlsbad Energy Center Project	)	

Comments from Intervener Terramar Regarding CEC Staff's Docketed  
Comments entitled, "Staff Responses to Comments Made by the Center for  
Biological Diversity Pertaining to Staff's Greenhouse Gas Emissions  
Analysis"

Kerry Siekmann  
Catherine Miller  
5239 El Arbol Dr.  
Carlsbad, Ca. 92008  
760-438-5611

February 9, 2012

Terramar was shocked to see the "Staff Responses to Comments Made by the Center for Biological Diversity Pertaining to Staff's Greenhouse Gas Emissions Analysis" docketed February 2, 2012.

The CECP presiding member had not directed staff to prepare such a document. So this appears to be a violation of § 1723.5.

**§ 1723.5. Presentation of Evidence; Burdens of Producing Evidence; Burdens of Proof. (a)6:**

(b) The staff shall present its independent assessment of the need for the facilities and of the adequacy of the measures proposed by the applicant to protect environmental quality and to protect public health and safety. The staff may also present evidence on any other matter relevant to the proceeding and shall present evidence on such matters and issues as the presiding member directs.

Terramar wonders if CEC staff has lost their required independent status by deciding to file this unrequested Response document. Title 20 makes it very clear to Terramar that CEC staff is required to remain independent in their assessments and evaluations of power plant applications.

**§1712.5. Staff as an Independent Party:**

In carrying out its duties pursuant to this chapter, the staff of the commission shall be an independent party to all notice, application, and exemption proceedings.

The CECP Presiding Member did not request Reply Briefs or Responses; in fact, all parties were limited to 10 pages in our Comments after the December 12, 2011 hearing. This document should be stricken from the record. But, as Biological Diversity has pointed out, the damage has been done. CEC staff should know their rules better than any of the parties as they define staff's actions each and every day. Therefore, Terramar supports Biological Diversity in their claim that they should be able to file a Response to staff's inappropriate document.

Instead of preparing what appears to be a "reply brief" in opposition to a single intervener, CEC staff should have been docketing the CAISO draft report that appeared on the CAISO website January 31, 2012. The 296 slide presentation from CAISO was a significant part of the December 12, 2011 hearing and it is surprising that CEC staff has not docketed the underlying report.

Terramar wonders if CEC staff did not docket this report because they wish to avoid inserting into the record that CAISO states on pages 218-219:

*This long-term assessment is preliminary because the official long-term supply and demand outlook is typically carried out under the CPUC Long-Term Procurement Plan (LTPP) process with significant participation from various stakeholders. The ISO assessment that is described here is preliminary, and would serve as an indication of potential trends or areas of concerns*  
Page 218-219

CAISO makes it very clear that this report is preliminary and cannot yet be relied upon for demand outlook.

Staff should understand how preliminary the CAISO report is as they are required to use the latest adopted strategic plan when assessing the need for transmission corridors per Title 20, Chapter 6, Article 2, § 2329 CEC staff is required to use the latest adopted strategic plan when assessing proposed transmission corridors.

**§ 2329. Preparation of Environmental Report, Need Assessment, and Staff's Role.**

(b) The staff shall also be responsible for independently assessing the need for the proposed transmission corridor and whether it conforms with the latest adopted strategic plan.

Terramar can only hope that CEC staff will step back and look at all the information regarding the CECP with independent eyes in the future.



BEFORE THE ENERGY RESOURCES CONSERVATION AND DEVELOPMENT  
 COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA  
 1516 NINTH STREET, SACRAMENTO, CA 95814  
 1-800-822-6228 – WWW.ENERGY.CA.GOV

**APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATION  
 FOR THE CARLSBAD ENERGY  
 CENTER PROJECT**

**Docket No. 07-AFC-6  
 PROOF OF SERVICE**  
 (Revised 11/29/2011)

**APPLICANT**

Jennifer Hein  
 George Piantka, PE.  
 NRG Energy, Inc., West Region  
 5790 Fleet Street, Ste. 200  
 Carlsbad, CA 92008  
[jennifer.hein@nrgenergy.com](mailto:jennifer.hein@nrgenergy.com)  
[george.piantka@nrgenergy.com](mailto:george.piantka@nrgenergy.com)

**APPLICANT'S CONSULTANTS**

Robert Mason, Project Manager  
 CH2M Hill, Inc.  
 6 Hutton Centre Drive, Ste. 700  
 Santa Ana, CA 92707  
[Robert.Mason@ch2m.com](mailto:Robert.Mason@ch2m.com)

Megan Sebra  
 CH2M Hill, Inc.  
 2485 Natomas Park Drive, Ste. 600  
 Sacramento, CA 95833  
[Megan.Sebra@ch2m.com](mailto:Megan.Sebra@ch2m.com)

**COUNSEL FOR APPLICANT**

John A. McKinsey  
 Stoel Rives, LLP  
 500 Capitol Mall, Suite 1600  
 Sacramento, CA 95814  
[jamckinsey@stoel.com](mailto:jamckinsey@stoel.com)

**INTERESTED AGENCIES**

California ISO  
[e-recipient@caiso.com](mailto:e-recipient@caiso.com)

**INTERVENORS**

Terramar Association  
 Kerry Siekmann & Catherine Miller  
 5239 El Arbol  
 Carlsbad, CA 92008  
[siekmann1@att.net](mailto:siekmann1@att.net)

City of Carlsbad  
 South Carlsbad Coastal  
 Redevelopment Agency  
 Allan J. Thompson  
 21 "C" Orinda Way #314  
 Orinda, CA 94563  
[allanori@comcast.net](mailto:allanori@comcast.net)

City of Carlsbad  
 South Carlsbad Coastal  
 Redevelopment Agency  
 Joseph Garuba,  
 Municipals Project Manager  
 Ronald R. Ball, Esq., City Attorney  
 1200 Carlsbad Village Drive  
 Carlsbad, CA 92008  
[Joe.Garuba@carlsbadca.gov](mailto:Joe.Garuba@carlsbadca.gov)  
[ron.ball@carlsbadca.gov](mailto:ron.ball@carlsbadca.gov)

California Unions for Reliable Energy  
 (CURE)  
 Marc D. Joseph  
 Adams Broadwell Joseph & Cardozo  
 601 Gateway Boulevard, Suite 1000  
 South San Francisco, CA 94080  
[gsmith@adamsbroadwell.com](mailto:gsmith@adamsbroadwell.com)  
[mdjoseph@adamsbroadwell.com](mailto:mdjoseph@adamsbroadwell.com)

Center for Biological Diversity  
 c/o William B. Rostov  
 EARTH JUSTICE  
 426 17th Street, 5th Floor  
 Oakland, CA 94612  
[wrostov@earthjustice.org](mailto:wrostov@earthjustice.org)

Power of Vision  
 Julie Baker & Arnold Roe, Ph.D.  
 4213 Sunnyhill Drive  
 Carlsbad, California 92013  
[julbaker@pacbell.net](mailto:julbaker@pacbell.net)  
[roe@ucla.edu](mailto:roe@ucla.edu)

Rob Simpson  
 Environmental Consultant  
 27126 Grandview Avenue  
 Hayward, CA 94542  
[rob@redwoodrob.com](mailto:rob@redwoodrob.com)

April Rose Sommer  
 Attorney for Rob Simpson  
 P.O. Box 6937  
 Moraga, CA 94570  
[aprilsummerlaw@yahoo.com](mailto:aprilsummerlaw@yahoo.com)

Center for Biological Diversity  
 c/o William B. Rostov  
 EARTH JUSTICE  
 426 17th Street, 5th Floor  
 Oakland, CA 94612  
[wrostov@earthjustice.org](mailto:wrostov@earthjustice.org)

**ENERGY COMMISSION –  
 DECISIONMAKERS**

JAMES D. BOYD  
 Vice Chair and Presiding Member  
[jboyd@energy.state.ca.us](mailto:jboyd@energy.state.ca.us)

KAREN DOUGLAS  
 Commissioner and Associate Member  
[kldougla@energy.state.ca.us](mailto:kldougla@energy.state.ca.us)

Galen Lemei  
 Adviser to Commissioner Douglas  
[glemei@energy.state.ca.us](mailto:glemei@energy.state.ca.us)

Tim Olson  
 Adviser to Vice Chair Boyd  
[tolson@energy.state.ca.us](mailto:tolson@energy.state.ca.us)

Paul Kramer  
 Hearing Officer  
[pkramer@energy.state.ca.us](mailto:pkramer@energy.state.ca.us)

**ENERGY COMMISSION STAFF**

Mike Monasmi  
 Siting Project Manager  
[mmonasmi@energy.state.ca.us](mailto:mmonasmi@energy.state.ca.us)

Dick Ratliff  
 Staff Counsel  
[dratliff@energy.state.ca.us](mailto:dratliff@energy.state.ca.us)

**ENERGY COMMISSION – PUBLIC  
 ADVISER**

Jennifer Jennings  
 Public Adviser's Office  
[publicadviser@energy.state.ca.us](mailto:publicadviser@energy.state.ca.us)

\*indicates change

ENERGY COMMISSION STAFF

**DECLARATION OF SERVICE**

I, Kerry Siekmann, declare that on, February 9, 2012, I served and filed copies of the attached Comments from Intervener Tenamar dated February 9, 2012

The original document, filed with the Docket Unit or the Chief Counsel, as required by the applicable regulation, is accompanied by a copy of the most recent Proof of Service list, located on the web page for this project at: **[[www.energy.ca.gov/sitingcases/carlsbad/index.html](http://www.energy.ca.gov/sitingcases/carlsbad/index.html)].**

The document has been sent to the other parties in this proceeding (as shown on the Proof of Service list) and to the Commission's Docket Unit or Chief Counsel, as appropriate, in the following manner:

**(Check all that Apply)**

**For service to all other parties:**

- Served electronically to all e-mail addresses on the Proof of Service list;
- Served by delivering on this date, either personally, or for mailing with the U.S. Postal Service with first-class postage thereon fully prepaid, to the name and address of the person served, for mailing that same day in the ordinary course of business; that the envelope was sealed and placed for collection and mailing on that date to those addresses marked "hard copy required."

**AND**

**For filing with the Docket Unit at the Energy Commission:**

- by sending an original paper copy and one electronic copy, mailed with the U.S. Postal Service with first class postage thereon fully prepaid and e-mailed respectively, to the address below (preferred method); **OR**
- by depositing an original and 12 paper copies in the mail with the U.S. Postal Service with first class postage thereon fully prepaid, as follows:

**CALIFORNIA ENERGY COMMISSION – DOCKET UNIT**  
Attn: Docket No. 07-AFC-6  
1516 Ninth Street, MS-4  
Sacramento, CA 95814-5512  
[docket@energy.state.ca.us](mailto:docket@energy.state.ca.us)

**OR, if filing a Petition for Reconsideration of Decision or Order pursuant to Title 20, § 1720:**

- Served by delivering on this date one electronic copy by e-mail, and an original paper copy to the Chief Counsel at the following address, either personally, or for mailing with the U.S. Postal Service with first class postage thereon fully prepaid:

California Energy Commission  
Michael J. Levy, Chief Counsel  
1516 Ninth Street MS-14  
Sacramento, CA 95814  
[mlevy@energy.state.ca.us](mailto:mlevy@energy.state.ca.us)

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the foregoing is true and correct, that I am employed in the county where this mailing occurred, and that I am over the age of 18 years and not a party to the proceeding.

Kerry Siekmann