



**CALIFORNIA
ENERGY COMMISSION**



**CALIFORNIA
natural
resources
AGENCY**

California Energy Commission

STAFF REPORT

Localized Health Impacts Report

Addendum 4 for Projects with Location Changes Awarded
Funding Through the Clean Transportation Program Under
Solicitation GFO-15-603 – DC Fast Chargers for California's
Interregional Corridors

Gavin Newsom, Governor

April 2020 | CEC-600-2016-008-AD4-REV1

California Energy Commission

Jonathan Bobadilla

Michael Comiter

Primary Author

Thanh Lopez

Brian Fauble

Commission Agreement Manager

Mark Wenzel

Office Manager

TRANSPORTATION POLICY AND ANALYSIS OFFICE

Kevin Barker

Deputy Director

FUELS AND TRANSPORTATION DIVISION

Drew Bohan

Executive Director

DISCLAIMER

Staff members of the California Energy Commission prepared this report. As such, it does not necessarily represent the views of the Energy Commission, its employees, or the State of California. The Energy Commission, the State of California, its employees, contractors and subcontractors make no warrant, express or implied, and assume no legal liability for the information in this report; nor does any party represent that the uses of this information will not infringe upon privately owned rights. This report has not been approved or disapproved by the Energy Commission nor has the Commission passed upon the accuracy or adequacy of the information in this report.

ADDENDUM 4

The Localized Health Impacts (LHI) Report for Selected Projects Awarded Funding Through the Clean Transportation Program Under Solicitation GFO-15-603 was posted November 10, 2016 (CEC-600-2016-008).¹ This addendum uses the same approach to assess the LHI for projects with location changes. ChargePoint, Inc. has proposed to replace eight electric-vehicle direct-current (DC) fast-charging station locations with eight new locations and 12 potential backup locations. Recargo, Inc. has proposed to replace seven electric vehicle DC fast charging station locations with seven new locations. The newly proposed locations are described in Table 1, along with environmental justice (EJ) indicators² (See Appendix A). Charger quantity and type for the new locations are similar to the original proposals.

Table 1: Original and New Site Locations for ChargePoint, Inc. and Recargo, Inc. Along With EJ Indicators

Grantee	Original Site Location	New Site Location	EJ Indicator(s)
ChargePoint, Inc.	71 E. Via La Plata, Fresno, CA 93245	7890 Blackstone Avenue, Fresno, CA 93720	Poverty, Unemployment, and Minority
ChargePoint, Inc.	850 W. Hobson Way Blythe, CA 92225	876 W. Donlon Street Blythe, CA 92225	Poverty, Unemployment, and Minority
ChargePoint, Inc.	1345 Healdsburg Avenue, Santa Clarita, CA 95548	3746 Airway Drive, Santa Rosa, CA 95403	N/A
ChargePoint, Inc.	19105 Golden Valley Road, Santa Clarita, CA 91387	879 Hopper Avenue, Santa Rosa, CA 95403*	N/A
ChargePoint, Inc.	19105 Golden Valley Road, Santa Clarita, CA 91387	19307 Golden Valley Road, Santa Clarita, CA 91387	Unemployment

1 Brecht, Patrick. 2016. *Localized Health Impacts Report Under Solicitation GFO-15-603-DC Fast Chargers for California's Interregional Corridors*. California Energy Commission, Fuels and Transportation Division. Publication Number: CEC-600-2016-008.

2 [EJ indicators](https://www.epa.gov/ejscreen/environmental-justice-indexes-ejscreen) developed by the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA), Office of Policy, <https://www.epa.gov/ejscreen/environmental-justice-indexes-ejscreen>.

Grantee	Original Site Location	New Site Location	EJ Indicator(s)
ChargePoint, Inc.	19105 Golden Valley Road, Santa Clarita, CA 91387	26900 Sierra Hwy, Santa Clarita, CA 91321*	Unemployment
ChargePoint, Inc.	19105 Golden Valley Road, Santa Clarita, CA 91387	16550 W. Soledad Canyon Road, Santa Clarita, CA 91387*	Unemployment
ChargePoint, Inc.	4701 Valley W. Boulevard, Arcata, CA 95521	801-899 F Street, Arcata, CA 95521	Poverty
ChargePoint, Inc.	4701 Valley W. Boulevard, Arcata, CA 95521	925 E Street, Arcata, CA 95521	Poverty
ChargePoint, Inc.	4701 Valley W. Boulevard, Arcata, CA 95521	1901 Heindon Road, Arcata, CA 95521*	Poverty
ChargePoint, Inc.	4701 Valley W. Boulevard, Arcata, CA 95521	1424 Broadway Street, Eureka, CA 95501*	Poverty
ChargePoint, Inc.	10527 Cold Stream Road, Truckee, CA 96161	9932 Donner Pass Road, Truckee, CA 96161	Minority
ChargePoint, Inc.	10527 Cold Stream Road, Truckee, CA 96161	12353 Deerfield Drive, Truckee, CA 96161*	Minority
ChargePoint, Inc.	1001 Heavenly Village Way, South Lake Tahoe, CA 96150	2977 US-50, South Lake Tahoe, CA 96150	Minority
ChargePoint, Inc.	1001 Heavenly Village Way, South Lake Tahoe, CA 96150	961 Emerald Bay Road, South Lake Tahoe, CA 96150*	Minority
ChargePoint, Inc.	1001 Heavenly Village Way, South Lake Tahoe, CA 96150	2870 Lake Tahoe Boulevard, South Lake Tahoe, CA 96150*	Minority

Grantee	Original Site Location	New Site Location	EJ Indicator(s)
ChargePoint, Inc.	1001 Heavenly Village Way, South Lake Tahoe, CA 96150	3651 Lake Tahoe Boulevard, South Lake Tahoe, CA 96150*	Minority
ChargePoint, Inc.	49901 Hwy 14, Inyokern, CA 93527	4467 US-395, Inyokern, CA 93527	Poverty and Unemployment
ChargePoint, Inc.	49901 Hwy 14, Inyokern, CA 93527	2565 CA-14, Inyokern, CA 93527*	Poverty and Unemployment
ChargePoint, Inc.	49901 Hwy 14, Inyokern, CA 93527	6525 W. Inyokern Road, Inyokern, CA 93527*	Poverty and Unemployment
ChargePoint, Inc.	49901 Hwy 14, Inyokern, CA 93527	6764 Mountain View Avenue, Inyokern, CA 93527*	Poverty and Unemployment
Recargo, Inc.	15870 US-101, Klamath, CA 95548	700 US-101, Crescent City, CA 95531	Poverty, Minority, and Unemployment
Recargo, Inc.	1220025 US-101, Orick, CA 95555	121200 US-101, Orick, CA 95555	Poverty and Unemployment
Recargo, Inc.	1929 4th Street, Eureka, CA 95501	1912 Broadway Street, Eureka, CA 95501	Poverty
Recargo, Inc.	1929 4th Street, Eureka, CA 95501	3505 Broadway St., Eureka, CA 95503*	Poverty
Recargo, Inc.	1328 Eeloa Ave., Rio Dell, CA 95562	1805 Alamar Way, Fortuna, CA 95540	Unemployment
Recargo, Inc.	1328 Eeloa Ave., Rio Dell, CA 95562	1791 Riverwalk Dr., Fortuna, CA 95540*	Unemployment
Recargo, Inc.	67676 CA-271, Leggett, CA 95585	66150 CA-271 Leggett, CA 95585	Poverty
Recargo, Inc.	212 South Main St., Willits, CA 95490	871 South Main St., Willits, CA 95490	Poverty
Recargo, Inc.	10021 Pacheco Pass Hwy, Hollister, CA 95023	1460 E. Pacheco Boulevard, Los Banos, CA 93635	Poverty, Minority, and Unemployment

Grantee	Original Site Location	New Site Location	EJ Indicator(s)
Recargo, Inc.	10021 Pacheco Pass Hwy, Hollister, CA 95023	849 W E Pacheco Blvd., Los Banos, CA 93635*	Poverty, Minority and Unemployment
Recargo, Inc.	16447 Elgin Ave., Dos Palos, CA 93620	23519 Robertson Blvd., Chowchilla, CA 93610	Poverty and Minority
Recargo, Inc.	13771 Highway 101, Hopland, CA 95449	6301 Hembree Ln., Windsor, CA 95492*	Minority
Recargo, Inc.	33 Healdsburg Ave., Healdsburg, CA 95448	6301 Hembree Ln., Windsor, CA 95492*	Minority
Recargo, Inc.	28821 Gonzaga Rd., Santa Nella, CA 95322	28991 Gonzaga Rd., Santa Nella, CA 95322*	Poverty, Minority and Unemployment

Source: California Energy Commission staff. *Backup locations shown with an asterisk (*) after new site location address.

Air Quality and EJ Indicators

The newly proposed electric vehicle charging station in Fresno, Blythe, Inyokern, Los Banos, Santa Nella, and Chowchilla are in nonattainment³ zones for ozone, particulate matter (PM⁴) 2.5, and PM 10. Santa Clarita is in a nonattainment zone for ozone and PM 2.5. Orick, Eureka, Fortuna, Leggett, and Willits are in nonattainment zones for PM 10. Santa Rosa is in a nonattainment zone for ozone. If a project site is in a nonattainment zone and has more than one EJ indicator (shown in Table 1) as detailed in Table 2, it is considered a high-risk community, according to the Environmental Justice Screening Method (EJSM).⁵

Table 2 shows a comparison of proposed project locations with the state average and staff's EJ indicator thresholds. When a project located in a nonattainment zone has more than one EJ indicator category exceeding the threshold, it is considered a high-risk community project location (with a dagger in Table 2). For instance, the proposed project location in Fresno is in a nonattainment zone and exceeded the EJ thresholds for poverty level, persons of Hispanic or

3 "Nonattainment zones" are areas designated by the California Air Resources Board (CARB) with at least one violation of an air quality standard for pollutants within the last three years, as of June 2017.

4 "Particulate matter" is unburned fuel particles that form smoke or soot and stick to lung tissue when inhaled. The numbers stand for microns in diameter.

5 California Air Resources Board (CARB). 2010. *Air Pollution and Environmental Justice, Integrating Indicators of Cumulative Impact and Socio-Economic Vulnerability Into Regulatory Decision-Making*. (Sacramento, California) Contract authors: Manuel Pastor Jr., Ph.D., Rachel Morello-Frosch, Ph.D., and James Sadd, Ph.D.

Latino origin, and unemployment, making it a high-risk community project location. According to staff's assessment, the proposed project locations in Fresno, Blythe, Inyokern, Orick, Los Banos, and Chowchilla are high-risk community project locations.

Table 2: EJ Indicators by Project Location City Demographic

	Below Poverty Level (2017)	Black Persons (2017)	American Indian and/or Alaska Native (2017)	Asian and/or Pacific Islander (2017)	Persons of Hispanic or Latino Origin (2017)	Persons Under 5 Years of Age (2017)	Persons Over 65 Years of Age (2017)	Unemployment (October 2018)
California	11.1%	5.8%	0.7%	14.5%	38.8%	6.4%	13.2%	4.2%
EJ Indicator Threshold	>11.1%	>30%	>30%	>30%	>30%	>26.4%	>33.2%	>4.2%
Fresno	22.9%*	3.8%	1.4%	3.2%	64.9%*	9.0%	8.6%	9.1%*
Blythe	24.4%*	14.0%	0.5%	0.9%	63.9%*	8.6%	11.1%	4.7%*
Santa Rosa†	10.4%	1.6%	1.0%	5.8%	21.0%	6.2%	7.8%	2.7%
Santa Clarita†	9.3%	5.2%	0.2%	24.7%	23.4%	8.7%	5.5%	5.1%*
Arcata†	34.2%*	2.8%	1.6%	3.0%	15.1%	2.5%	4.8%	3.6%
Eureka	19.9%*	2.9%	3.4%	3.6%	14.1%	5.0%	6.7%	3.6%
Truckee†	6.9%	0.4%	0.3%	1.1%	38.7%*	7.5%	6.5%	3.4%
South Lake Tahoe†	10.7%	0.6%	0.5%	4.6%	44.2%*	6.6%	9.2%	3.5%
Inyokern†	17.0%*	1.5%	0.9%	2.8%	9.5%	5.2%	18.4%	7.3%*
Crescent City	29.1%*	7.8%	3.4%	3.5%	35.9%*	2.8%	8.1%	7.9%*
Orick	34.6%*	0.0%	10.9%	0.0%	5.6%	0.0%	20.0%	4.4%*
Fortuna	8.0%	0.6%	3.7%	0.9%	17.0%	7.1%	17.3%	5.0%*
Leggett	28.1%*	0.0%	2.5%	0.0%	3.3%	6.6%	9.8%	3.5%
Los Banos	20.2%*	7.8%	3.4%	3.5%	35.9%*	2.8%	8.1%	7.9%*
Chowchilla	25.1%*	10.2%	2.6%	1.7%	45.2%*	5.0%	8.9%	2.6%

	Below Poverty Level (2017)	Black Persons (2017)	American Indian and/or Alaska Native (2017)	Asian and/or Pacific Islander (2017)	Persons of Hispanic or Latino Origin (2017)	Persons Under 5 Years of Age (2017)	Persons Over 65 Years of Age (2017)	Unemployment (October 2018)
Willits	22.8%*	0%	4.5%	1.1%	18.5%	6.6%	18.0%	3.2%
Windsor	1.6%	0.5%	0.9%	3.5%	31.7%*	4.9%	14.8%	2.8%
Santa Nella	33.1%*	3.0%	0.0%	3.2%	70.5%*	9.7%	11.5%	10.4%*

Sources: California Energy Commission staff, Employment Development Department, and U.S. Census Bureau. *The city/county names in **bold** indicate a high-risk community, while the asterisk (*) next to the percentages indicate which categories exceed the EJ indicator threshold. **A dagger (†) after the city name signifies a default to county demographics and/or labor information.

Location Analysis and Community Impacts

The proposed charging station locations and the EJ indicators used are comparable to the original LHI report. The charger quantity and type, along with the estimated gasoline gallons displaced, are also comparable, and the anticipated impact to the communities where the electric vehicle DC fast chargers will be located remains positive in terms of cleaner air and anticipated greenhouse gas reductions.

Public Comment

As provided by Title 13 CCR Section 2343 of the California Code of Regulations, a 30-day public review period applies to this LHI report from the date it is posted on the CEC website. The [original posting date for this report](#) is listed at ww2.energy.ca.gov/altfuels/documents/.

The CEC encourages comments by email. Please include your name or organization's name in the name of the file. Send comments in either Microsoft® Word format (.doc) or Adobe® Acrobat® format (.pdf) to FTD@energy.ca.gov.

The public can email comments to FTD@energy.ca.gov or send them to:

California Energy Commission
 Fuels and Transportation Division
 1516 Ninth Street, MS-44
 Sacramento, CA 95814-5512

All written comments will become part of the public record and may be posted to the Internet.

News media should direct inquiries to the Media and Public Communications Office at (916) 654-4989 or by email at mediaoffice@energy.ca.gov.

APPENDIX A:

Localized Health Impacts Report Method

This LHI report assesses the potential health impacts on communities from projects proposed to receive Clean Transportation Program funding. This LHI report is prepared under the *California Code of Regulations, Title 13, Motor Vehicles, Chapter 8.1 (CCR § 2343)*:

“(6) Localized health impacts must be considered when selecting projects for funding. The funding agency must consider EJ consistent with state law and complete the following:

(A) For each fiscal year, the funding agency must publish a staff report for review and comment by the public at least 30 calendar days prior to the approval of projects. The report must analyze the aggregate locations of the funded projects, analyze the impacts in communities with the most significant exposure to air contaminants or localized air contaminants, or both, including, but not limited to, communities of minority populations or low-income populations, and identify agency outreach to community groups and other affected stakeholders.

(B) Projects must be selected and approved for funding in a publicly noticed meeting.”

This LHI report is not intended to be a detailed pollution analysis of proposed projects nor is it intended to substitute for the environmental review conducted during California Environmental Quality Act. This LHI report includes staff’s application of the EJSM developed by the U.S. EPA to help identify projects in areas where social vulnerability indicators, high exposure to pollution, and greater health risks are present.

CEC staff identifies high-risk community project locations using data from California Air Resources Board, the U.S. Census Bureau, and other public agencies. Staff analyzes these data to assign EJ indicators for each project location specified in the LHI report. The proposed project location must meet a two-part standard as follows:

Part 1 – Environmental Standard:

- Communities located within an air quality nonattainment zone for ozone, PM 2.5, or PM 10, as designated by the California Air Resources Board for criteria pollutants.

Part 2 – Demographic Standard:

- Communities having more than one of the following EJ indicators for (1) minority, (2) poverty, (3) unemployment, and (4) age. The EJ indicator thresholds is defined by staff as:
 - 1) A minority subset represents more than 30 percent of a given city’s population.
 - 2) A city’s poverty level exceeds the state average poverty level.

- 3) The city (or county if city data is unavailable) unemployment rate exceeds the state average unemployment rate.
- 4) The percentage of people living in a city who are younger than 5 years of age or older than 65 years of age is 20 percent higher than the state average for persons under 5 years of age or over 65 years of age.