



**CALIFORNIA  
ENERGY COMMISSION**



California Energy Commission  
Clean Transportation Program

## **FINAL PROJECT REPORT**

# **Employment Training Panel Workforce Training Program**

**Prepared for: California Energy Commission**

**Prepared by: Employment Training Panel**

**March 2023 | CEC-600-2023-002**



# California Energy Commission

Tiffany Maslac

**Primary Author**

Employment Training Panel

1100 J Street, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor

Sacramento, CA 95814

(916) 327-5640

[Employment Training Panel](http://www.etp.ca.gov) Website [www.etp.ca.gov](http://www.etp.ca.gov)

**Agreement Number: 600-09-016**

Larry Rillera

**Commission Agreement Manager**

Mark Wenzel

**Office Manager**

**LIGHT-DUTY ELECTRIC VEHICLE INFRASTRUCTURE AND ANALYSIS  
OFFICE**

Hannon Rasool

**Deputy Director**

**FUELS AND TRANSPORTATION DIVISION**

Drew Bohan

**Executive Director**

## **DISCLAIMER**

**This report was prepared as the result of work sponsored by the California Energy Commission (CEC). It does not necessarily represent the views of the CEC, its employees, or the State of California. The CEC, the State of California, its employees, contractors, and subcontractors make no warrant, express or implied, and assume no legal liability for the information in this report; nor does any party represent that the use of this information will not infringe upon privately owned rights. This report has not been approved or disapproved by the CEC nor has the CEC passed upon the accuracy or adequacy of the information in this report.**

# **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

The Employment Training Panel's Workforce Training Final Report was prepared with contributions from Assistant Director, Peter Cooper, and the following staff:

- Robert Meyer
- Phillip Boyer
- Renee Pierce
- Kelsey Oehrke
- Sandra Trujillo-Graham
- Barry Worthington
- Mario Maslac
- Nancy Tran
- Alayna Mollic

# PREFACE

Assembly Bill 118 (Núñez, Chapter 750, Statutes of 2007) created the Clean Transportation Program, formerly known as the Alternative and Renewable Fuel and Vehicle Technology Program. The statute authorizes the California Energy Commission (CEC) to develop and deploy alternative and renewable fuels and advanced transportation technologies to help attain the state's climate change policies. Assembly Bill 8 (Perea, Chapter 401, Statutes of 2013) reauthorizes the Clean Transportation Program through January 1, 2024, and specifies that the CEC allocate up to \$20 million per year (or up to 20 percent of each fiscal year's funds) in funding for hydrogen station development until at least 100 stations are operational.

The Clean Transportation Program has an annual budget of about \$100 million and provides financial support for projects that:

- Reduce California's use and dependence on petroleum transportation fuels and increase the use of alternative and renewable fuels and advanced vehicle technologies.
- Produce sustainable alternative and renewable low-carbon fuels in California.
- Expand alternative fueling infrastructure and fueling stations.
- Improve the efficiency, performance, and market viability of alternative light, medium, and heavy-duty vehicle technologies.
- Retrofit medium and heavy-duty on-road and nonroad vehicle fleets to alternative technologies or fuel use.
- Expand the alternative fueling infrastructure available to existing fleets, public transit, and transportation corridors.
- Establish workforce-training programs and conduct public outreach on the benefits of alternative transportation fuels and vehicle technologies.

To be eligible for funding under the Clean Transportation Program, a project must be consistent with the CEC's Clean Transportation Program Investment Plan. The Employment Training Panel entered into Interagency Agreement 600-09-016 with the CEC. The Interagency Agreement provides funds for eligible projects that meet the tenets of the Clean Transportation Program for workforce training through the Employment Training Panel statutorily mandated sub-contracting process. The Interagency Agreement was executed in 2010.

## ABSTRACT

Deployment of clean transportation technologies requires a prepared and trained workforce. The CEC, through the Clean Transportation Program established workforce-training programs to increase awareness of environmental benefits of clean transportation technologies and economic benefits of clean transportation economies and workers. An Interagency Agreement with the Employment Training Panel and other state workforce entities provided a workforce training foundation for the CEC to initiate the requisite worker training to advance alternative and renewable fuel and vehicle technologies. The CEC provided a total of \$11,518,124 to the Employment Training Panel to conduct workforce training to eligible applicants.

**Keywords:** Clean transportation, electric vehicle (EV), Employment Training Panel (ETP), zero-emission vehicles (ZEV)

Maslac, Tiffany. 2023. *California Employment Training Panel Workforce Training Project*. California Energy Commission. Publication Number: CEC-600-2023-002.



# TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
Acknowledgements .....	i
Preface.....	ii
Abstract .....	iii
Table of Contents.....	v
List of Figures .....	v
List of Tables .....	vi
Executive Summary.....	1
CHAPTER 1: Interagency Agreement.....	3
Background .....	3
Scope of Work and Deliverables .....	5
CHAPTER 2: Fiscal .....	8
Fiscal Summary.....	8
Expenditures.....	8
ETP Core Program Funding .....	9
Multiple Employer Contract .....	9
CHAPTER 3: Marketing and Outreach .....	10
CHAPTER 4: Project Performance.....	14
Contractor Performance.....	14
Conclusion .....	16
Recommendations.....	16
Glossary .....	18

## LIST OF FIGURES

	Page
Figure 1: Amalgamated Transit Union Local #265 Trainee.....	10
Figure 2: Los Angeles Economic Development Corporation Event.....	11
Figure 3: California-Germany Transport Committee Meeting .....	13
Figure 4: ETP presenting at the Zero-Emission Bus Technology Showcase and Symposium ...	13

# LIST OF TABLES

Page

Table 1: Summary of Agreement Amendments .....	8
Table 2: Summary of Unspent Funds.....	9



## **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

Interagency Agreement 600-09-016 provided \$11,518,124 in Clean Transportation Program funding to the Employment Training Panel to establish performance-based workforce training. Funds supported worker training in alternative and renewable fuel and vehicle technologies. Training was conducted to alternative transportation markets including, but not limited to, biofuel production, transit fuel conversions, first and second responder training, electric vehicle manufacturing, and research and development for private sector companies and municipalities.

Employment Training Panel has administered training for 47 contracts and approximately 10,000 workers under the Interagency Agreement. Trainee industries include green technology, transportation/logistics, manufacturing, services, and construction. Training topics include manufacturing skills, business skills, computer skills, commercial skills, and advanced technology. Occupations included engineers, technicians, mechanics, operators, drivers, managers and supervisors, production workers, administrative staff, sales staff, service foreman, field service staff, among others.

The Interagency Agreement leveraged Employment Training Panel existing administrative and marketing structure. The pay-for-performance contract structure and project feedback informed program evaluations and process improvements.



# CHAPTER 1:

## Interagency Agreement

---

### Background

The Clean Transportation Program<sup>1</sup> invests up to \$95 million annually in a broad portfolio of clean transportation projects throughout the state. The CEC leverages public and private investments to support adoption of clean transportation powered by alternative and renewable fuels. The CEC's Fuels and Transportation Division administers the Clean Transportation Program.

The Clean Transportation Program plays an important role in achieving California's goals for climate change, petroleum reduction, adoption of ZEV, maintaining air quality standards, and sustaining long-term economic growth. The CEC is committed to providing opportunities to participate in and benefit from clean transportation projects for diverse, disadvantaged, and low-income communities.

Using funds collected from vehicle and vessel registration, vehicle identification plates, and smog abatement fees, the program:

- Expedites development of fueling and charging infrastructure for ZEVs.
- Accelerates advancement and adoption of alternative fuel and advanced technology vehicles, including low- and zero-emission medium- and heavy-duty vehicles.
- Expands in-state production of alternative, low-carbon renewable fuel from low-carbon pathways.
- Supports manufacturing and workforce training to translate clean technology investments into sustained employment opportunities.

The ETP<sup>2</sup> was created in 1982 with a mandate to address the large displacement of workers resulting from a series of plant closures by moving these displaced workers into jobs. ETP promotes a healthy labor market, with an emphasis on helping businesses overcome the challenge of out-of-state and international competition. ETP responds to changes in economic conditions and workforce needs. ETP has provided approximately \$1.5 billion for the training and employment retention of over one million workers employed by over 80,000 California businesses<sup>3</sup> since its inception.

ETP is organized under the Labor and Workforce Development Agency. The Labor and Workforce Development Agency is led by a cabinet-level secretary which encompasses the ETP, Department of Industrial Relations, Employment Development Department, Agricultural Labor Relations Board, California Workforce Development Board, Unemployment Appeals Board, and Public Employment Relations Board. ETP retains its autonomy under Labor and

---

<sup>1</sup> [Clean Transportation Program](https://www.energy.ca.gov/programs-and-topics/programs/clean-transportation-program). California Energy Commission. <https://www.energy.ca.gov/programs-and-topics/programs/clean-transportation-program>

<sup>2</sup> [Employment Training Panel](https://etp.ca.gov/). State of California. <https://etp.ca.gov/>

<sup>3</sup> [Employment Training Panel overview](https://etp.ca.gov/program-overview/). State of California. <https://etp.ca.gov/program-overview/>

Workforce Development Agency, acting independently to disburse funds and set program policy.

ETP is governed by an eight-member labor/management panel. Seven members are appointed by the Governor and Legislative leaders. The eighth member is the Director of the Governor's Office of Business and Economic Development or a designee who serves ex-officio as a voting member. The ETP approves training proposals, adopts program policies and regulations, and hears appeals.

ETP has authority to receive and expend "Alternative Funding Source" monies. Alternative Funding Source "means funding appropriated to the ETP for the purposes of the ETP Core Program, or other workforce training program, from a source other than the Employment Training Tax."<sup>4</sup>

Employment Development Department provides fiscal, accounting, and invoicing support to ETP. Employment Development Department is reimbursed for administrative and transactional support to the IA.

The ETP has approved the following industries sectors as "Priority Industry" as defined by their NAICS Codes (North American Industry Classification System):<sup>5</sup>

- Agriculture.
- Allied Healthcare.
- Biotechnology and Life Sciences.
- Construction.
- Green/Clean Technology.
- Goods Movement and Transportation Logistics.
- Information Technology Services.
- Manufacturing/Food Production.
- Multimedia/Entertainment.
- Technical Services.

Within these industries, the ETP also supports the following other initiatives:

- Job Creation Priorities.
- Critical Proposals – Governor's Office of Business and Economic Development Referrals.
- Projects Serving Veteran Trainees.
- Small Business Projects.
- Clean Transportation Program.
- Drought – Rapid Employment Strategies Pilot on Natural Disasters.
- Pilots and Guidelines.

---

<sup>4</sup> [Employment Training Panel regulations](https://etp.ca.gov/wp-content/uploads/sites/70/2018/11/ETP_Regulations.pdf). State of California. [https://etp.ca.gov/wp-content/uploads/sites/70/2018/11/ETP\\_Regulations.pdf](https://etp.ca.gov/wp-content/uploads/sites/70/2018/11/ETP_Regulations.pdf)

<sup>5</sup> [Employment Training Panel Funding Priorities and Limitations](https://etp.ca.gov/program-overview/funding-limitations/). State of California. <https://etp.ca.gov/program-overview/funding-limitations/>

ETP reimburses the cost of employer-funded training for incumbent workers and unemployed workers that seek to re-enter the workforce through a pay-for-performance contract. An employer may earn ETP funds only after a trainee completes all training and is retained by the employer for a minimum period, normally 90 days, at a specified wage and in a job using the skills learned during the training.

ETP uses two contract formats: 1) a single employer for employers training their own full-time workers, and 2) a multiple employer contractor (MEC) training the employees of multiple employers brought together by industrial or occupational linkages. ETP only reimburses the contractor for training in the CEC approved training curriculum delivered within the terms of the contract. The ETP contract structure allows for some flexibility such as letting employers select training topics, training providers, delivery methods, and schedules to train and upskill existing workers. The employer earns funds only after the trainee completes training and then a post-training, employment retention period during which the trainee works full-time earning above a contract specific minimum wage.

## **Scope of Work and Deliverables**

The Interagency Agreement contains standard contract formatting including tasks, task description, Scope of Work, deliverables, schedule and product due dates, and a budget. Identified below are elements of the Interagency Agreement that provide detail on the tasks and requisite actions:

### 1) Task I. Subcontractor Eligibility Guidelines and Subcontract Templates

ETP shall develop subcontractor eligibility guidelines to direct the selection of eligible subcontractors to deliver CEC-specific workforce training. ETP shall consult with the CEC to develop subcontractor eligibility guidelines for CEC-specific workforce training. The CEC must approve the subcontractor eligibility guidelines in writing prior to implementation.

#### Task I: Deliverables

- Subcontractor eligibility guidelines (draft and final).
- Subcontract template (draft and final).
- Subcontract summary template (draft and final).

### 2) Task II. Outreach and Marketing

ETP shall conduct outreach and marketing to identify eligible subcontractors in need of CEC-specific workforce training. The goal is to increase awareness of this clean transportation workforce training for eligible employers, training agencies, and workforce development organizations. ETP shall conduct outreach to companies and organizations upon CEC referral and report the status of these projects in the quarterly outreach and marketing activities report.

#### Task II: Deliverables

- Outreach and marketing plan.
- Quarterly outreach and marketing activities reports.

### 3) Task III. Workforce Training Delivery Subcontracts.

ETP shall disburse CEC funds through training subcontracts with single employers, MECs, training agencies, trade associations, joint apprenticeship training councils, labor

unions, and other eligible entities. Subcontractors eligible to receive funds shall provide workforce training for job skills related to the development and/or deployment of alternative fuels and vehicle technologies.

#### Task III: Deliverables

- Summaries of proposed subcontracts.
- Requests for approved subcontract funds.

#### 4) Task IV. Subcontract Administration, Monitoring, Technical Assistance and Reporting

ETP shall administer all subcontracts funded in accordance with the ETP's core program including conducting start-up meetings and monitoring visits.

#### Task IV: Deliverables

- Subcontract monitoring reports.

#### 5) Task V. Outcomes Tracking and Reporting

ETP shall track outcomes and prepare quarterly reports for all subcontracts that provide participant and program outcomes. The reports shall include, but not be limited to:

- Contract data: status of CEC referrals; number of startups, monitoring, and final visits; number of contracts (in development, approved, number of active contracts, and number of completed contracts).
- Funds: projects in development, subcontracts awarded by quarter and by date, subcontract funds encumbered, subcontract funds earned, funds unearned, funds returned to the ETP, and fund balance.
- Participant data: number of trainees enrolled, completed, placed in a job, new hires, current employees/re-trainees, and training related employment.
- Participant demographics: county of residence, county of employment, hours of training completed, earnings prior to training, earnings post training, and long-term earning potential.

#### Task V. Deliverables

- Quarterly outcomes data reports.

#### 6) Task VI. Annual and Final Performance Reports

ETP shall prepare an annual report for each the first and second year of the Interagency Agreement and a Workforce Training Final Report (final report). These reports shall represent all activities delivered during a year and in the case of the final report throughout the term of the IA. The annual and final reports shall include cumulative performance and outcomes data as detailed in quarterly reports. The final report shall provide an overall summary of the activities performed under each task, performance measures and statistics, summary of the number of training contracts delivered and funding allocated by county, data on continued demand for workforce training outside the term of the IA, project strengths and weaknesses, determination of success, recommendations, and conclusions.

#### Task VI. Deliverables

- Annual reports (draft and final).
- Final report (draft and final).

## 7) Task VII. Meetings

The goal of this task is to discuss program status and review program management. Participants will include the CEC, ETP, and any other individuals selected by the CEC or the ETP to participate. The meetings will be held quarterly, at a minimum, or based on expressed need.

### Task VII. Deliverables

- Schedule of quarterly meetings.
- Agenda for each meeting.
- List of expected participants.

# CHAPTER 2:

## Fiscal

---

### Fiscal Summary

The Interagency Agreement provided ETP with a total of \$11,518,124 in CEC funds to fund training contracts, conduct marketing and outreach, and provide administrative services and support. Administrative costs were capped at 10 percent. During the Interagency Agreement, three amendments allowed the CEC to provide additional program funds and to extend the terms of the agreement as summarized in Table 1:

**Table 1: Summary of Agreement Amendments**

<b>Amendment Number</b>	<b>Amount</b>	<b>Interagency Agreement Term</b>
Initial	\$6,000,000	March 24, 2010 to February 24, 2013
1	\$4,280,000	March 24, 2010 to February 28, 2016
2	\$1,238,124	March 24, 2010 to March 30, 2017
3*	\$0	March 24, 2010 to March 20, 2019
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>\$11,518,124</b>	

**\*Amendment #3 was a no-cost time extension for an additional 2 years.**

Source: ETP

The Interagency Agreement between the CEC and ETP initially provided \$6,000,000 for workforce training delivery contracts and program administrative costs. Amendment #1 provided an additional \$4,280,000 and extended the term by three years. Amendment #2 provided an additional \$1,238,124 and extended the term by 11 months. Amendment #3 was a no-cost time extension of two years and for a one-time advance payment for expiring funds (unexpended funds) that was originally approved in the initial funding to ETP.

### Expenditures

ETP marketing and outreach expenditures include staff time, travel and event sponsorship. ETP marketing and outreach staff time is tracked and reported along with other administrative staff costs. ETP collected data on the limited number of hours of staff time dedicated to activities under the IA. The time spent is primarily attributed to events, reporting, and follow-up with interested parties.

Travel and event sponsorships were funded under the ETP Core Program Marketing Cost Center (03934) and Expense Codes (962 Event Sponsorship, 520 Travel Expense Claim, Car Rental and Airfare). Given the considerable overlap with ETP core program engagement, ETP determined that they would manage all engagement sponsorship and travel costs within the core program budget administrated by ETP's Economic Development Unit.

ETP did not receive new CEC funding in fiscal year 2012-2013. ETP had an unspent balance of \$4,200,000 from the accumulation of funds that were not spent on contracts since the inception of the IA. ETP received \$3,000,000 in reimbursable authority via the Section 28.50 of



the enacted state budget<sup>6</sup>. Although \$4,200,000 was available in unspent funds, the \$3,000,000 amount approved by the Department of Finance was based on ETP's average annual expenditure over the prior three years of the IA.

ETP also submitted a fiscal year 2013-2014 Budget Change Proposal that requested on-going reimbursable budget authority of \$3,000,000 in the Unemployment Administration Fund. ETP's rationale for this Budget Change Proposal stems from ETP's experience with the approval process for a Section 28.50. The four to six-month approval process prevented ETP from approving training contracts on a timely basis. In order to prevent these delays from occurring in the future, ETP made a request for ongoing reimbursable authority.

ETP estimates that approximately \$500,000 was expended for administrative costs based on Employment Development Department expenditure reports. According to the Cal Jobs General Ledger (state fiscal database), \$8,900,000 was expended for direct training contracts, for a total of \$9,400,000 in total expenses. ETP also estimates that just over \$2,200,000 in funds were unspent and disencumbered or returned to the CEC as shown in the Table 2.

**Table 2: Summary of Unspent Funds**

<b>Unspent Funds (Amount)</b>	<b>Date</b>
\$558,166	July 14, 2012
\$1,128,124	July 2, 2013
\$554,543	June 26, 2014
<b>Total \$2,240,833</b>	

Source: ETP

## **ETP Core Program Funding**

ETP has utilized one funding source to support training in clean transportation from the Employment Training Tax Fund and the alternative source funding from the CEC. ETP has sought to meet the employer needs while ensuring the funds are used in compliance with statute. Some key statutory and known differences between the funding requirements separates certain types of projects funded under each category. CEC funding is focused on alternative and renewable fuel and vehicle technology regardless of employer or entity. ETP core funding is primarily focused on private employers who pay into the Employment Training Tax Fund through a payroll tax deduction. ETP utilized some flexibility and approved private employers such as Tesla Motors, Inc., Applied Materials, Inc., and Buster Biofuels, LLC.

## **Multiple Employer Contract**

ETP has the authority to enter a contract with an employer where there are multiple employers and is referred to as a MEC. A MEC "means an agreement with ETP for the reimbursement of training costs, wherein the Contractor's duties and obligations are assumed by a group of employers, training agency or other eligible Contractor on behalf of multiple participating employers".<sup>4</sup>

<sup>6</sup> [2012-2013 California Governor's Budget](http://www.ebudget.ca.gov/2012-13-EN/Enacted/StateAgencyBudgets/7000/agency.html). State of California <http://www.ebudget.ca.gov/2012-13-EN/Enacted/StateAgencyBudgets/7000/agency.html>

# CHAPTER 3:

## Marketing and Outreach

---

Within the Interagency Agreement, ETP targeted potential projects through a statewide marketing plan. ETP created awareness of and demand for projects by targeting key industry groups and associations, working with state and local economic and workforce development organizations, collaborating with public and private partners to expand connections to eligible employers.

ETP’s marketing and outreach efforts via in-person meetings, webinars, presentations, training (figure 1) focused on:

- Upskilling incumbent workers rather than training for unemployed job seekers entering the alternative fuels industry sector.
- Working with existing ETP contractors familiar with the ETP performance-based contracting model, for increased likelihood of a successful contract.
- Identifying key stakeholders in need of external resources to support the demand and growth of job skills in clean transportation technologies.
- Orientating employers to ETP’s contracting process and requirements.
- Promoting pollution reduction goals to companies, industry associations, and partnerships.
- Working with clean transportation supply chains.

**Figure 1: Amalgamated Transit Union Local #265 Trainee**



Source: Amalgamated Transit Union Local #265

- Job skills for drivers and fueling technicians including fleet-based partnerships.
- Increased engagement with industry associations including the Imperial Economic Development Corporation that supported biofuel and biomass conversion.
- As a member of the Advisory Committee for the Investment Plan of the Clean Transportation Program, ETP leveraged interest in the program from retail car sales and dealership stakeholders for potential projects.
- First and second responders.
- Other state workforce entities including the California Workforce Development Board.

In October 2018, ETP and the Los Angeles Economic Development Corporation hosted a listening session to gather information on the economic and workforce development needs of clean transportation technology companies in Los Angeles (figure 2). The event included interactive presentations from employers, providers, and government funding entities.

**Figure 2: Los Angeles Economic Development Corporation Event**



Source: ETP

ETP leveraged several existing partnerships as part of its initial marketing and outreach efforts under the Interagency Agreement. ETP worked closely with Governor's Office of Business and Economic Development to coordinate employer recruitment and retention, cross-promotional events with entities at the State Treasurer's Office, collaboration with the California Community Colleges with El Camino Community College District Center for Applied and Competitive Technology, and the California Labor Federation, AFL-CIO, with several public transit agencies to support implementation of California Transit Works!

Outside the IA, ETP was able to leverage CEC funded marketing and outreach activities to new audiences including:

- Participation on the ZEV Interagency Working Group providing status reports on program activities and funded projects.
- Providing feedback and recommendations to expand workforce and job skills training related content found in the Governor's "Zero-Emission Vehicles in California: Community Readiness Guidebook."<sup>7</sup>
- Engaging the California New Car Dealers Association and Capital Area Plug-in Electrical Vehicle Coordinating Council through the North State Building Industry Association to look at integrating infrastructure technologies and light-duty EV regional planning into a statewide training program.
- Targeting first and secondary responder training for fueling infrastructure.
- Upgrade training for journeypersons to support EV charging station installation in partnership with International Brotherhood of Electrical Workers-National Electrical Contractors Association.
- In July 2018, the Transit Committee of the State Parliament of Baden-Wuerttemberg, Germany, visited Sacramento. Attendees talked with state officials about traffic management, new mobility, autonomous driving, and ZEV technologies. The discussion focused on events in California and strategies to reduce air pollution, address climate change, and grow the economy. ETP hosted the event (figure 3) and coordinated with the Governor's Office, CEC, California Air Resources Board Sacramento Regional Transit District, University of California at Davis International Center for Clean Transportation, and other state and local partners. The event supported the work of the Under2 Coalition<sup>8</sup> established in 2015 by former Governor Brown and Baden-Wuerttemberg Minister Winfried Kretschmann.

---

<sup>7</sup> [Zero Emission Vehicles](http://opr.ca.gov/planning/transportation/zev.html). Governor's Office of Planning and Research <http://opr.ca.gov/planning/transportation/zev.html>

<sup>8</sup> [Under2 Coalition homepage](https://www.under2coalition.org/). <https://www.under2coalition.org/>



**Figure 3: California-Germany Transport Committee Meeting**



Source: ETP

In February 2019, ETP participated in the Zero-Emission Bus Technology Showcase and Symposium (figure 4) co-hosted by the Antelope Valley Transit Authority, California Transit Association, and California Air Resource Board in Sacramento. A panel on Workforce Training and Technology Trouble Shooting provided detail on how the California transit community is deploying Zero-Emission Bus.

**Figure 4: ETP presenting at the Zero-Emission Bus Technology Showcase and Symposium**



Source: California Air Resources Board

# CHAPTER 4:

## Project Performance

---

Although ETP's training project had a slow start, employers have utilized the support and training in clean technology and innovation to further develop and focus on job skills and training. ETP has been able to leverage the marketing and outreach work it has done and employer interest in this sector for ETP core funding when needed. The program has allowed ETP to form new and unique partnerships in support of CEC, ETP, and Governor's ZEV and climate goals.

In 2011, California Labor Federation AFL-CIO was awarded with their first workforce training contract with ETP. Since 2011, they have been awarded two additional contracts in 2013 and 2016 to train over 3,000 trainees. These contracts included a robust partnership with labor unions, a public transit employer, and a community college. Furthermore, they supported career pathways leading to high-wage, high-benefit jobs in a high-unemployment, disadvantaged region of the state that has been disproportionately impacted by pollution.

El Camino College has been a multiple contract recipient since 2011. Eldon Davidson, the director of the Center for Customized Training at El Camino College as said "This alternative fuel and vehicle funding contract allows El Camino College and its training partners to offer education, training, and resources to increase employee's job skills in advanced transportation and clean technologies."<sup>9</sup>

ETP approved 47 contracts over the course of the Interagency Agreement. Five of those contracts regularly encumbered funds on an annual basis. Five contracts were terminated within the first two years of the Interagency Agreement. Key training partners include California Labor Federation AFL-CIO, Tesla Motors Inc., El Camino Community College, Competitive Technologies, and John L Sullivan Chevrolet, Inc.

### Contractor Performance

Identified below are key projects and contract performance by fiscal year:

- 2009-2010 - Five contracts were funded with \$495,134 paid at an earnings rate of 27 percent of the total approved funding amount. A key project was California Manufacturers and Technology Association that earned \$367,006 with 66 percent earnings and 141 job-placed trainees. There were also three projects that were terminated.
- 2010-2011 - Ten contracts were funded with \$2,534,005 paid at an earnings rate of 69 percent of the total approved funding amount. A key project was Blue Sky Bio-Fuels, LLC that earned \$57,551 with 97 percent earnings and 14 job-placed trainees. There were also two projects that were terminated.

---

<sup>9</sup> ETP, "2017-2018 Annual Report." <https://etp.ca.gov/wp-content/uploads/sites/70/2019/06/2017-2018ETPAnnualReport-ACCESSIBLETEXT.pdf> (accessed March 20, 2019)

- 2011-2012 - Seven contracts were funded with \$206,457 paid at an earnings rate of 16 percent of the total approved funding amount. A key project was United Parcel Service that earned \$16,515 with 71 percent earnings and 231 job-placed trainees.
- 2012-2013 - Four contracts were funded with \$1,893,358 paid at an earnings rate of 61 percent of the total approved funding amount. A key project was Tesla Motors Inc. that earned \$648,000 with 100 percent earnings and 511 job-placed trainees.
- 2013-2014 - Three contracts were funded with \$415,144 paid at an earnings rate of 86 percent of the total approved funding amount. A key project was El Camino Community College District Center for Applied Competitive Technologies that earned \$373,089 with 99 percent earnings and 349 job-placed trainees.
- 2014-2015 - Six contracts were funded with \$727,294 paid at an earnings rate of 66 percent of the total approved funding amount. A key project was John L Sullivan Chevrolet Inc. that earned \$21,196 with 91 percent earnings and 47 job-placed trainees.
- 2015-2016 - Six contracts were funded with \$1,481,461 paid at an earnings rate of 61 percent of the total approved funding amount. A key project was GFP Ethanol, LLC doing business as Calgren Renewable Fuels that earned \$47,568 with 96 percent earnings and 36 job-placed trainees.
- 2016-2017 - Two contracts were funded with \$753,850 paid at an earnings rate of 93 percent of the total approved funding amount. A key project was Buster Biofuels, LLC that produces biodiesel with 1 job-placed trainee.
- 2017-2018 - Two contracts were funded with \$729,206 paid at an earnings rate of 75 percent of the total approved funding amount. A key project was a second agreement with EL Camino Community District, and Competitive Technologies that earned \$329,206 with 61 percent earnings and 286 job-placed trainees.

# CHAPTER 5:

## Conclusion and Recommendations

---

### Conclusion

The program has been a successful in terms of leveraging ETP's administrative and marketing structure to provide workforce training. ETP's pay-for-performance contract structure has allowed for program evaluation and improvements. Over 45 contracts were approved serving employers, workers, and communities. Additionally, this program has enhanced high-road labor-management workforce training partnerships between employers, unions, and the state in growing California's economy.

ETP expanded its engagement of contractors with CEC funding and the use of ETP's core program funding. The ability to move funded projects between the CEC and ETP was helpful in the early years of the Interagency Agreement.

ETP gained valuable insight from industry representatives of the auto dealerships. Some dealerships were interested in increasing new car sales of hybrid and ZEV models through training in EV charging and incentives for EV charging. Given the high turnover of the retail sales occupations, lack of subject matter expert availability within the local dealership, difficulty of the statewide association to effectively aggregate and maintain local permitting information, contract performance of dealerships was limited.

ETP was able to highlight CEC-funded projects at the CEC's Technology Showcase celebrating 10 years of the Clean Transportation Program.

The marketing and outreach have been a success as all marketing and outreach funding earmarked from the Interagency Agreement were exhausted. ETP has cemented invaluable partnerships across the transportation and manufacturing industry sectors. These partnerships continue to allow ETP to remain current with the leading edge of economic and workforce development trends and seen as one of the most responsive State of California economic and workforce development programs.

### Recommendations

ETP recommends funding for the program with the following changes:

- Greater latitude and flexibility for employers wishing to train is needed. The training that is allowed is currently limited by CEC guidelines and a very rigid interpretation of the governing statute, which does not allow for much flexibility. Some private sector employers have decided to forego CEC funding and use ETP core funding due to this constraint. Additional areas such as continuous improvement or research and development could help ETP promote CEC funding more efficiently.
- CEC should allow as eligible, general industry-related courses that are part of Division of Apprenticeship Standards approved pre-apprenticeship and apprenticeship programs.
- Allow the use of funds for capacity-building grants for underserved communities.
- Coordination, where possible, with other state workforce initiatives, including the new LDWA initiatives relating to the Future of Work and the California Workforce Development Boards High Road Training Partnerships.



- Communicate new or additional CEC procedures that need to be followed in submitting invoices or documentation necessary to receive funding and be able to reimburse employers who have earned the training funds.
- Provide greater predictability to employers regarding payments.

# GLOSSARY

**CALIFORNIA ENERGY COMMISSION (CEC)**—The state agency established by the Warren-Alquist State Energy Resources Conservation and Development Act in 1974 (Public Resources Code, Sections 25000 et seq.) responsible for energy policy. The Energy Commission's five major areas of responsibilities are:

1. Forecasting future statewide energy needs
2. Licensing power plants sufficient to meet those needs
3. Promoting energy conservation and efficiency measures
4. Developing renewable and alternative energy resources, including providing assistance to develop clean transportation fuels
5. Planning for and directing state response to energy emergencies.

**ELECTRIC VEHICLE (EV)**—An electric vehicle that uses one or more electric motors or traction motors for propulsion. An electric vehicle may be powered through a collector system by electricity from off-vehicle sources, or may be self-contained with a battery, solar panels or an electric generator to convert fuel to electricity. EVs include, but are not limited to road and rail vehicles, surface and underwater vessels, electric aircraft and electric spacecraft.

**EMPLOYMENT TRAINING PANEL (ETP)**—The Employment Training Panel is a business and labor-supported state agency that funds the costs of vocational training. ETP is governed by an 8-member Panel. ETP is funded by the Employment Training Tax (ETT), paid by California companies participating in the Unemployment Insurance system to promote the development and training of California workers.

**MULTIPLE EMPLOYER CONTRACT (MEC)**—A multiple-employer contract serves more than one employer under a single ETP contract and may be a group of employers, a training agency, or a local Workforce Development Board.

**ZERO EMISSION VEHICLE (ZEVs)**—Is a vehicle that emits no exhaust gas from the onboard source of power such as electricity or hydrogen.